This is the published version of a paper published in *Scandinavian Journal of Hospitality and Tourism*.

Citation for the original published paper (version of record):

Tourism and the Sámi in transition: a discourse analysis of Swedish newspapers from 1982 to 2015
https://doi.org/10.1080/15022250.2017.1329663

Access to the published version may require subscription.

N.B. When citing this work, cite the original published paper.

Permanent link to this version:
http://urn.kb.se/resolve?urn=urn:nbn:se:umu:diva-142736
Tourism and the Sámi in transition: a discourse analysis of Swedish newspapers, 1982–2015

Jundan Zhang and Dieter Müller

Department of Geography and Economic History, Umeå University, Umeå, Sweden

ABSTRACT
This article aims to contribute to a more nuanced understanding of how tourism in Sápmi is positioned in the broader discourses that contribute to the construction of Sámi identities. This is done through examining how the tourism industry is represented in the ethno-political discourses in newspaper media. Employing a discourse analysis framework, we collected 165 articles from 29 major Swedish newspapers for the period 1982–2015. The results show that the ethno-political discourses construct, and are constructed by, the discursive practice of tourism in Sápmi, thus forming an ongoing dialectical process. This process entails three aspects. First, while some narratives in newspapers construct a social knowledge that portrays the Sámi people as “exotic others” in the global and domestic tourism industry, others show that tourism can also be an opportunity to challenge such a view. Second, these news narratives demonstrate how the ethno-political discourses are intertwined in the social relations between tourism and other natural-resource-based industries. Third, an ever-changing social identity construction shows that, with the changing role of reindeer herding in the Sámi identity, how tourism assists or challenges this association is becoming increasingly important.

Introduction

The relationship between tourism and indigenous peoples has been a recurrent topic for tourism research (e.g. Butler & Hinch, 2007; Carr, Ruhnen, & Whitford, 2016; Lemelin & Blangy, 2009; Ryan & Aicken, 2005). In that context tourism has often been understood as a remedy to contested indigenous livelihoods and hence, indigenous tourism research attempted not least to find ways forward. However, indigenous tourism development is contingent of time and space (Weaver, 2010) and thus, it is difficult to assess indigenous tourism as a global phenomenon without recognizing the particularities of each place and indigenous group (Smith, 1996). Butler and Hinch (2007) suggested an indigenous tourism system to acknowledge the complexities of the phenomenon; networks among indigenous and non-indigenous as well as tourism and non-tourism stakeholders are embedded in physical, political, economic and socio-cultural environments. From this perspective it
becomes reasonable to focus the experience of the Sámi in particular, since this group is embedded in a distinct welfare state environment (Müller & Viken, 2017), and to focus media representations as important reflections but also agents of change.

Sápmi is the homeland of the Sámi, the indigenous people in the North who have inhabited Sweden, Norway, Finland, and Russia for centuries. About 20,000 Sámi reside in Sweden, and approximately 4600 of them are reindeer owners in the traditional industry of reindeer husbandry, which has recently been challenged by climate change and global market competition (Samiskt informationscentrum, 2016). In the case of northern Sweden, Sápmi is also situated in an area that is socio-culturally, politically and economically peripheral and thus has limited access to decision-making processes concerning development plans (Müller, 2011; Zillinger, 2006). In this context of marginalization, tourism has been suggested as an alternative source of income, not least for reindeer-herding Sámi, in order to provide preconditions for making a living in the new rural economy in the peripheral region (Lundmark, Fredman, & Sandell, 2010; Lundmark & Stjernström, 2009; Müller & Pettersson, 2001). Thus, various public bodies, like the Swedish Sámi parliament and Swedish authorities, expect tourism growth to be an important medium for the exchanges between the Sámi communities and non-Sámi society, in economic aspects as well as others (Sametinget, 2014). Indeed, research indicates that employment in tourism has been an important alternative to reindeer herding (Leu & Müller, 2016).

Previous studies have looked at tourism in Sápmi in socio-cultural, political, economic and environmental contexts (Lundmark, 2005; Müller & Pettersson, 2006; Saarinen, 2007), for instance examining the representations of Sáminess in the tourism industry or tourism promotion (Niskala & Ridanpää, 2016; Olsen, 2006; Pettersson & Viken, 2007). However, as for other indigenous peoples (Hinch & Butler, 2007; Radcliffe & Laurie, 2006), scholars note that the tourism representation of the Sámi is often discussed in a dichotomist manner (such as tradition/modernity, colonized/colonial and authentic/commercial), in aspects of not only cultural and social characteristics but also economic development and land use (Müller & Pettersson, 2001, 2006; Niskala & Ridanpää, 2016).

Media representations have been a topic of discussion, as indigenous peoples are frequently used in order to sell destinations (Dann, 1996; Hollinshead, 1996; Lew, 1998). Even in an Arctic context, it has been argued that the Sámi have often been used in stereotypical ways to represent the northern destination as exotic (Niskala & Ridanpää, 2016; Saarinen, 1999). However, Hollinshead (2007) argues that indigenous people cannot be seen only as victims. Instead, they are increasingly able to exercise their own agency and influence their public image, for example through the arts and cultural activities. In this article we situate tourism development in Sápmi within the context of ethno-political discourses, through which the definition of Sáminess is constructed in a set of political documents, legislation and public media (Müller & Pettersson, 2006). Surprisingly, while there has been research on the representation of Sámi through the public media (see Peterson, 2003; Pietikäinen, 2001, 2003, 2008), little is understood regarding how the so-called Sámi tourism is represented and discussed in the media, particularly newspapers. We therefore aim to fill this gap by looking at the news representation of the tourism development in Sápmi, with a focus on Swedish newspapers.

Employing Fairclough’s discourse analysis framework (Fairclough & Wodak, 1997), we collect 165 articles from 29 major Swedish newspapers for the period 1982–2015. The following research questions are investigated in the study:
- How is Sámi tourism represented in the news? What kind of relationships between tourism and other industries can be interpreted from these representations? Are there any changes in these relationships over time?
- How are the Sámi people represented in these materials?

We position ourselves along the line of a more nuanced understanding of Sámi “indigeneity” (Viken & Müller, 2017), which encourages us to critically reconsider an alternative to the homogenous group the Sámi (like other “indigenous peoples”) are often portrayed as. Viken and Müller (2017) remind us that “indigenous” is a modern term that is mostly constructed and used in social, academic and political contexts (Kuper, 2003). Thus, research on indigenous peoples should shift the focus towards “indigeneity”, which discusses more the connections between group and locality (instead of ethnicity or race) (Viken & Müller, 2017).

As Smith (1996) notes, the situation for indigenous peoples is contingent on geographical and historical circumstances influencing their development to date on the one hand, and their relation to the dominant culture on the other. Hence, though the Sámi’s situation resembles many of the problems known from indigenous populations elsewhere, they also differ in that they neither are colonized in the same way as other indigenous peoples are, nor suffer to the same extent from demographic, economic and social marginalization (Viken & Müller, 2017). Many research challenges related to Sámi involvement in tourism are thus not mirrored in the international research agenda, which is still dominated by a desire to empower and provide income to indigenous people (Whitford & Ruhanen, 2016). As a consequence, it was concluded already early on that there are no global explanations or remedies for indigenous tourism development (Getz & Jamieson, 1997). Therefore, our research does not attempt to sketch any global theory concerning the extremely heterogeneous group of indigenous peoples.

We do, however, attempt to add to the current understanding of tourism in Sápmi in two ways. One is methodological; while previous studies on tourism in Sápmi have focused on collecting materials through interviews, participant observation and surveys (Leu & Müller, 2016; Müller & Kuoljok Huuva, 2009; Müller & Pettersson, 2006), we focus on written materials in this study. Furthermore, while previously written material that has been analysed has mainly comprised tourism promotion media such as brochures (Fonneland, 2013; Niskala & Ridanpää, 2016), we collect the written material from Swedish newspapers. The other potential contribution lies in the theoretical understanding of the Sámi’s indigeneity: through analysing the newspaper narratives, we wish to make better sense of how tourism in Sápmi is positioned in the broader discourses that contribute to the construction of Sámi identities.

Background

Indigenous tourism and Sámi tourism

The development of indigenous tourism is contingent on a variety of factors, as has been shown in a number of recent publications (Butler & Hinch, 2007; Carr et al., 2016; Lemelin & Blangy, 2009). In a recent special issue on sustainable tourism and indigenous people presented in the Journal of Sustainable Tourism, the editors classify the contributions as
reminiscent of either the positive or the negative realities of indigenous tourism, respectively (Carr et al., 2016). Although it is easy to agree that most tourism development includes aspects of capacity building and commodification, the above notion indicates the normative characteristics of many contributions to the debate on indigenous tourism. This certainly applies to research on Sámi tourism as well, but Müller and Kuoljok Huuva (2009) claim that even other aspects such as internal cultural constraints delimit and influence the development of indigenous tourism.

Smith (1996) once claimed that not least the interrelationship of the indigenous and majority populations is an important aspect for indigenous people’s willingness to engage in tourism. Most often, government – but also government-funded research – has regarded indigenous people as socially and economically disadvantaged, and tourism development has been promoted as a remedy to this situation (Hinch & Butler, 2007; Whitford & Ruhanen, 2016). Thus, many studies have been normative, identifying indigenous peoples as victims of colonialism and as groups in need of empowerment and protection, facing increasing touristic interest owing to globalization.

Weaver (2010) suggests a six-stage model for describing the development of indigenous tourism based on experiences from the antipode and North America. In the first pre-colonial stage, “tourism” is restricted to visiting friend and relatives. In the second stage, indigenous people are exposed to occasional visitors who portray indigenous people as non-modern and thus, soon vanishing. This triggered the third stage, in which indigenous culture and artefacts are exhibited, often in urban centres, in order to contrast the indigenous non-modern and the civilized modernity of the colonial powers. In the fourth stage, transportation enables an early mass-tourism to the homelands of the indigenous peoples. Tourism is organized by the dominant society, and cheap artefacts for sale as souvenirs appear as manifestation of this form of tourism.

While the initial four stages can be seen as expressions of a pre- and colonial relationship, the final ones are characterized by a struggle for de-colonization and indigenous control of tourism. In the fifth stage, Weaver argues, indigenous people take control of a tourism product, which has been developed by outside stakeholders. However, since this process is characterized by struggle and imperfect results (Buultjens, Waller, Graham, & Carson, 2005; Johnston, 2003), the resulting situation is described as quasi-empowerment. In the final stage, indigenous tourism entrepreneurs leave the realm of indigenous tourism products and diversify even geographically beyond their indigenous homelands (Weaver, 2010). The current position of Sámi tourism development can be seen as corresponding to Stage 5 in Weaver’s model. However, the historical–geographical setting of Sami tourism and the above-mentioned situation where Sami do not suffer from marginalization to the same extent as other indigenous peoples implies most likely that development patterns diverge from Weaver’s normative stage model, which is acknowledged not least for highlighting the process of empowerment within indigenous tourism (Fletcher, Pforr, & Brueckner, 2016; Higgins-Desbiolles, Trevorrow, & Sparrow, 2014; Whitford & Ruhanen, 2016).

Swedish Sámi tourism in the ethno-political discourses

In the case of indigeneity for the Swedish Sámi, the way their identities are related to their lands and environments is constructed through a dialectical relationship between the
Swedish State and the Sámi groups themselves. This relationship is rather dynamic, and generates discursive practices that form a set of ethno-political discourses (Müller & Pettersson, 2006). We have learned from historical research on Sámi people that the Sámi culture has always been in transition, as the group has never lived in isolation from other groups in northern Europe, and the changes experienced by the Sámi people have become even more profound since the late 1800s (Lehtola, 2004). Today, Sámi and non-Sámi live side by side in the area, and the Sámi are a non-visible minority highly integrated into Swedish society, particularly compared to other indigenous populations around the world (Whitford & Ruhanen, 2016). According to historical accounts, nomadic reindeer herding emerged as the number of wild reindeer decreased at the end of the Middle Ages (Lehtola, 2004). It is only after the fifteenth century that reindeer herding became industrial, with the ancient skills and traditions found in reindeer hunting maintained through the herding. The first Reindeer Grazing Act in 1886 defined the Sámi people as homogeneous reindeer herders, which is not only an ignorant assumption but also represents a colonial discourse and strategy, with the aim to construct a fixed identity for the Sámi people (Lantto, 2015; Lantto & Mörkenstam, 2008).

The Reindeer Grazing Act and other relevant land use policies force many Sámi reindeer herders into a dilemma: to stay in Sápmi with its declining reindeer-herding industry to remain a “real Sámi”, or to start a life somewhere else, detached from reindeer herding and the Sámi community (Müller & Pettersson, 2006). The decision to change their livelihood is still closely linked to the issues of Sámi rights and identity, as the “order of discourse” and “power to define” largely remain unchanged after a century of Sámi political mobilization (Lantto & Mörkenstam, 2008). Unable to maintain their life quality in Sápmi, many reindeer-herding Sámi are pushed into pursuing other modern industry in this dilemma, though some of them may also simply decide to stop herding reindeer because they want another occupation (Müller & Pettersson, 2001). It is this controversial situation that tourism enters as an alternative industry, not least since it seemingly allows the Sámi to stay in their homeland.

The parliament of the Swedish Sámi, Sametinget officially acknowledges that tourism is an important industry that allows the Sámi to remain in Sápmi and conduct their traditional livelihoods (particularly reindeer herding), yet the development of tourism in Sápmi has not been smooth. Since the 1990s, only a few Swedish Sámi have engaged in the tourism industry (Müller & Kuoljok Huuva, 2009). According to Müller and Kuoljok Huuva (2009), the reasons for this are rather complicated and, again, are embedded in the ethno-political discourses. As Müller and Pettersson (2006) show, the ethno-political discourses continue to consist of both the internal debates within the Sámi groups and the external opinions of the politicians, media and tourists. Meanwhile, the recently renewed interest in the rich natural resources of northern Sweden is in competition with tourists’ increasing interest in “the last wilderness and indigenous people”, which includes the remaining reindeer-herding industry (Müller & Hoppstadius, 2017).

Tensions are generated not only from these conflicting interests per se, but also from how these interests have been represented, remanufactured and recycled in the various political and ideological agendas within the ethno-political discourses. Although the increasing employment and diversified economy are seen as important contributions of tourism (Müller & Brouder, 2014), people sometimes associate it with other, destructive, industries such as mining and forestry (Müller, 2013). Thus, just where tourism lies
within the discourse on Sámi rights is unclear. As Müller (2015) argues, the institutional and political conditions play a significant role in placing Arctic tourism in a less prioritized position and making it less trustworthy in terms of its stability for the long-term development. This again traces back to different groups within the Sámi community having been systematically and institutionally separated by the Reindeer Grazing Act, thus leading to different attitudes towards tourism. How the land use rights are allocated to different Sámi groups influences their desire and motivation to be involved in tourism. For example, the current legislation limits reindeer herders to be exclusively organized as a Sameby, the Sámi cooperative, and forbids the Sámi cooperatives from engaging in any business other than reindeer herding (SOU, 2001).

Previous research more or less agrees that tourism is only one facet of the alternative industries available to the Sámi people, with the concerns lying in whether tourism will help preserve or damage the traditional cultural and natural environments (Müller & Pettersson, 2001, 2006; Pedersen & Viken, 1996; Pettersson, 2002, 2006; Saarinen, 1997). Recent studies show that while Sámi tourism entrepreneurs expressed positive views on future tourism development, they also hoped for more acceptance and support from within the Sámi community (Müller & Hoppstadius, 2017; Müller & Kuoljok Huuva, 2009). Also, based on economic evidence from national census and population register data, it is interpreted that reindeer herders’ engagement in a particular field of tourism business is influenced by geographical resources rather than by an inherent inclination (Leu & Müller, 2016). Still, less research has explicitly explored the dialectical relationship between the ethno-political discourses and the development of Sámi tourism; thus, the dynamics and complexities during the process of establishing tourism as an alternative livelihood for the Sámi are still not fully understood.

Methodology and methods

We employ discourse analysis in this article, following Phillips and Hardy’s (2002) definition of a discourse as “an interrelated set of texts, and the practices of their production, dissemination, and reception, that brings an object into being” (p. 3). In this definition, social reality is produced through discourses, and we experience these realities through discourses. The discursive formation of objects, enunciative modalities, concepts, strategies and subjects indicates the active relation of discourse to reality. Discourse analysis thus entails “explor[ing] the relationship between discourse and reality” (Phillips and Hardy 2002), and is therefore a social constructivist and interpretivist approach to understanding society and events. In the fields of social science studies discourse analysis has been utilized, in which newspaper materials have been one important kind of research subject (Fairclough, 2003; Richardson, 2007).

In this study we used the media archive database Retriever Sverige, through Umeå University’s Library. Retriever Sverige is owned by the Swedish national news agency Tidningarnas Telegrambyrå (TT). Collecting and archiving digital entries for 700 Swedish daily newspapers beginning in 1945, the database is the ideal resource for searching the broadest collection of material in the Swedish media. In February 2016, we made a search with the key words “Samer” (Sámi) and “turism” (tourism), and the database recognized 407 articles. The earliest article appeared in the search results was from 1982, thus the starting year of our analysis. We excluded duplicate articles and those with similar content, as well
as advertisements. Ultimately, 165 relevant\textsuperscript{4} articles were selected. Noticeably, most of the articles are from regional newspapers of regions where the Sámi live (e.g. Östersundsposten, Västerbottens-Kuriren, Norrbottens-Kuriren, and Länstidningen Östersund). National newspapers include Dagens Nyheter, Folkbladet, Expressen and Aftonbladet. To conduct the analysis, we follow Fairclough’s “three-dimensional” framework (Fairclough, 1992), which “connects texts to discourses, locating them in a historical and social context, by which we refer to the particular actors, relationships, and practices that characterize the situation under study” (Phillips & Hardy, 2002, p. 4). Figure 1 shows that discourse is carried out through discursive practices, which are manifested in linguistic forms, such as spoken and written text, images, or any other semiotic forms; and the discursive practices in turn construct social practices.

We start by identifying the ethno-political discourse on Sámi tourism as a discursive practice. In the context of this paper, the discursive practice of Sámi tourism is presented through the production, distribution and consumption of the selected newspaper texts. The second stage, textual analysis, focuses on how propositions are structured, combined and sequenced. However, due to the space limitation, we pay more attention to the function of the texts in the discursive practice rather than to their linguistic function, as Richardson (2007) suggests. From there we proceed to the last step, in which a decoding process traces the meanings back to the economic, political and social settings within which the discursive practice is generated (Hall, 1980). Inevitably, these three steps of analysis overlap one another, and are therefore not fixated in a rigid manner.

As a result of the analysis, we identify emerging themes and focuses, and then categorize them following the three domains of Fairclough’s (1992, 1995) framework for discourse analysis, namely systems of knowledge and belief; social relationships; and social identities and subject positions (Fairclough, 1992, p. 64). Through the examples in the news articles, we hope to see how the ethno-political discourses construct a particular worldview, a particular relationship between different agencies, or a particular way of being and becoming.

\textbf{Figure 1.} Three-dimensional framework of discourse (based on Fairclough, 1992).
At the same time, the ethno-political discourses are reinforced, reshaped or negotiated through these discursive narratives. This dialectical perspective helps us observe that the discursive practices are often contradictory, and the power relations shown in these struggles are not only directed in one way. This process of sorting and making sense is highly interpretive and subjective in itself. Unfortunately, due to the space allowed in this article, we cannot provide more detailed interpretations or explanations of all articles. For the same reason, citations are limited.

Results

Through analysing the texts in the 165 articles, we come to see that the way tourism is contextualized in Sápmi is dynamic and ever-changing. The results challenge the normative and dichotomist understanding of how the tourism industry is developed, performed and perceived in previous research on Sámi tourism. This is shown in mainly three aspects, namely social knowledge (73 articles), social relationships (64 articles) and social identities (28 articles).

Tourism in the changing ethno-political discourses

What we see in the newspaper articles clearly reflects the ethno-political discourses on the Swedish Sámi: that the colonial/colonized and central/peripheral binary continue to exist throughout the years. However, the articles also present a more complicated picture, especially in the later years. The early years’ (1982–1990) articles demonstrate a simplified perspective on Sámi tourism, asserting that Sámi tourism development was ideal and welcomed by the Sámi community, while at the same time largely objectifying the Sámi and their culture (see, for example, Expressen, 1992-01-11; VK, 1989-02-02). Even in recent years, the colonial attitude can be observed through a simplified vision of preserving a timeless Sámi culture for the promotion of tourism:

The Sámi are one of few indigenous peoples of the world. By safeguarding the genuine culture and at the same time keeping it accessible for foreign visitors, we can develop the Sámi attractiveness even in the future, says Thomas Brühl, CEO Visit Sweden. (NS, 2012-10-12)

Several articles in the 1990s and early 2000s discussed tourism as a complementary industry in Sápmi, yet it was sometimes compared to reindeer herding and idealized as an unproblematic solution to complicated issues in the area. For instance, an article in the national Swedish newspaper Dagens Nyheter (1994-10-09) appealed for reaction to a degrading environment in northern Sweden; reindeer overgrazing was cited as one of the causes, and tourism was suggested to be a better option. And in another article in the same newspaper (DN, 2003-12-14), it was reported that increasing numbers of Sámi entrepreneurs were taking up tourism due to the growing interest in Sámi culture from international tourists. The facts that reindeer herding is an important part of Sámi culture, and that the Sámi have long maintained an ecological way of herding reindeer (Riseth, 2007; Turi & Keskitalo, 2014) are ignored. Tourism was also suggested for solving other problems such as declining reindeer husbandry, the “declining culture” in Sápmi, an ageing and declining population, and even the increasing number of predators. Such simplification echoes the asymmetrical power relations between different ways of
knowing, as noted in cases in Norwegian Sámi (Turi & Keskitalo, 2014). Importantly, this simplification can be observed on not only regional and national but also international scales (VK, 1997-09-01).

However, it is also important to note that in the ethno-political discourses there were more actors than just “the colonizer”. For instance, an article from the 1980s indicated that Sámi individuals also expressed a desire to take control of tourism products that were related to their culture (TT, 1984-02-21). Furthermore, a number of articles called for changes to the legal regulation and structure within Sámi society (see, for example, VF, 2002-10-31; LÖ, 2000-03-03; VF, 2006-02-15). The establishment of Sametinget, the parliament of the Swedish Sámi in 1993, and a network of Sámi tourism entrepreneurs, Sámisk turism i Sápmi, allowed these entities to also play certain roles in promoting tourism (see Expressen, 1994-01-29; Aftonbladet, 1994-12-11). The way tourism in Sápmi is represented in the news over the years mirrors the changing landscape of the ethno-political discourses, with the Sámi people taking a more active role in political, socio-cultural and economic debates. For instance, in several articles, Sámi individuals reflected on tourism in the context of the colonial history and governmental regulation (see TT Spektra, 2004-02-04; LÖ, 2000-03-03; ÖP, 2000-11-02), and tourism development in Sápmi was contested for its impacts. Concerns include the possibility that tourists may disturb reindeer habitats or that tourism modifies and commodifies the reindeer-herding traditions, or causes conflicts between different Sámi groups, to name a few (e.g. LÖ, 2000-03-03; GP, 2000-01-16). On the other hand, some saw tourism as a good opportunity to understand the changing Sámi society. In an article from 2002, Sámi tourism entrepreneur Maud Mattsson was interviewed for her ideas on having tourists in Sápmi:

I feel a demand on me that when we have guests here nothing should go wrong, because it might fuel myths and prejudices. I want the guests to learn more about reindeer husbandry and feel like they have a little more knowledge about it when they leave this place. (ÖP, 2002-10-18)

Such representations indicate that there are different attitudes on tourism even within the Sámi community. Nevertheless, tourism provides a platform for Sámi individuals to present themselves, and at times may even become a tool for demanding more power in the exchange with non-Sámi people. Especially in recent years, there appeared to be more personal stories of Sámi artists and how they integrate Sámi traditional art with (post)modern art products through handcrafting, as well as other descriptions of traditional food, medicine and music (e.g. ÄM, 2014-02-13; VK, 2015-01-24).

We also suggest seeing interactive and dialectical relationships in the way tourism is presented and represented in the articles. A strong willingness to collaborate was shown in articles from both the Swedish (NS, 2012-10-12) and the Sámi side (Norran, 2012-10-12; NS, 2012-10-12; LÖ, 2010-03-12), to achieve a more “authentic, respectful and sustainable” Sámi tourism (JP, 2015-03-14; MP, 2012-04-25), as well as to cope with broader issues such as climate change (LÖ, 2013-11-29). And as a response to the voice from the Sámi that tourism can help people see a changing and diverse Sámi community, there were articles hinting that it is only through tourism that the Sámi can be seen as modern (e.g. ÖP, 2014-10-27; LÖ, 2012-06-16; NK, 2014-05-24), which reinforces the simplified picture of the Sámi people.
Tourism as the better alternative?

The representations of tourism in Sápmi were constructed in connection with different actors and agencies, as a collective result that changes according to the ever-shifting dynamic relations among them. Such dynamic relations between tourism and other industries were represented in the analysed newspaper articles. As mentioned before, tourism was often posited in comparison to more traditional industries such as reindeer herding, and the understanding of tourism as a “modern” livelihood was even more prevalent in articles comparing tourism with other “modern” industries, such as mining, hydropower, wind power and forestry.

On the one hand, tourism in Sápmi was compared to other modern industries and described as a livelihood that is environmentally friendly, sustainable and economically profitable. This was done from both a Sámi and a non-Sámi perspective. For instance, a windmill proposal in Åre County was criticized by local Sámi, who asserted that it would hinder the plan to develop ecotourism in the mountainous area (ÖP, 2009-04-01). On the other hand, tourism was compared to reindeer herding and listed together with other modern industries. A comment from right-wing party leader Jimmie Åkesson even accused reindeer herding of taking space from other industries:

It’s very difficult to establish businesses on, in principle, a third of Sweden’s area because of reindeer husbandry. This in itself is also problematic. There should be a balance between different industries, so that Norrland’s inland can grow within tourism, aquaculture, and forestry, says Jimmie Åkesson. (DN, 2014-02-08)

Alongside the dominant voice that tourism represents more sustainable and profitable development and should thus be prioritized, another line of criticism argued that it is yet another form of colonialization. Arguments were developed in terms of how natural resources were exploited through tourism-related activities, and consequently how the Sámi culture, which was highly related to their livelihood, was marginalized, threatened and modified. Events such as opening mines and windmills provoked anger from the Sámi community, with the contested land ownership and tourism often accused alongside these modern industries (see, for example, DN, 2013-01-10; VF, 2009-02-17; Aftonbladet, 2005-02-06; GP, 2000-01-16). Again, the negative effects of tourism on reindeer herding, such as damage to the grazing lands’ environment, were brought up (LÖ, 2012-10-10; ÖP, 2001-05-22; ÖP, 2000-09-06; LÖ, 1997-12-13). Another aspect of criticizing tourism’s (post-)colonial nature is the cultural changes. An article on a book about the Sámi understanding of nature criticizes tourism for at its core resembling the capitalistic view of nature (VK, 2000-06-07). Thus, Sámi culture is exploited and commercialized as a marketing brand for developing tourism that mainly benefits the groups in mainstream Swedish society, it is stated (e.g. the use of Sámi symbols in the 2014 Umeå European Cultural Capital) (VK, 2011-09-08; ÖP, 2009-08-05). The Sámi tourism in Finland and the “Disneyfication” effect occurring there were taken as warnings for future tourism commercialization in Swedish Sápmi (ÖP, 2002-03-19). Overall, the question of whether tourism is a better alternative industry than others in Sápmi is highly contested. The analysis shows that tourism is intertwined in a network of different agents and stakeholders, and is often at the centre of conflicting interests. This in turn also indicates that there is an awareness of the interrelationship between tourism and other industries.
The “Sáminess” in tourism

How “Sáminess” is represented, constructed and utilized in tourism has been examined in previous studies (Niskala & Ridanpää, 2016; Viken, 2006). Through the articles here, it is also shown that as a consequence of the ethno-political discourses on Sápmi and the Sámi, Sáminess is constructed and negotiated through tourism.

First and foremost, Sáminess as an objectification of the Sámi used in tourism promotion was practised on several scales. On an international scale, “Sámi” was used as an icon targeting overseas tourists and was listed along with other Swedish icons such as IKEA, Dalecarlian horses, and even surströmming (see ÖP, 2011-09-03; Aftonbladet, 2011-04-25; ÖP, 2002-03-08). On a national level the Sámi people, together with the “north” (Northern Lights, Midnight Sun, reindeer), were depicted as exotic and thus attractive for domestic tourists (e.g. GP, 2006-09-06; LÖ, 2000-12-21; DN, 1999-10-24; Expressen, 2004-05-31; ÖP, 2004-03-11). On a regional scale, “Sámi” was used in descriptions of tourism products or activities in certain areas to add more value to the regional tourism product development (ÖP, 2002-05-30; MS, 2008-10-22; GP, 2001-12-08). This objectification has been observed in previous research (Saarinen, 1997) and echoes the colonial attitudes on the Sámi, as shown earlier.

However, a diversity of Sámi identity and culture was also shown in more recent articles, through personal stories of Sámi individuals who were often engaged in or alongside tourism activities. One article told the story of the Sámi woman Ingrid Sarri, who had grown up in a family that had been engaged in tourism for generations. After living with tourism for years, she reflected:

We were living in Nikkaloukta and were more outgoing than the other Sámi through our contact with tourists. Every day we had to get up, bake our bread, and cook lappkok using reindeer meat with carrots, potatoes and broth, and sell it to tourists. That’s why I have such an ambivalent feeling about my Sámi costume. I don’t want to have to wear it to say that this is Ingrid Sarri. (HD, 2000-08-27)

Sarri later decided to move to southern Sweden and look for her own identity outside the objectification of her Sáminess. However, being Sámi is still an important part of her identity, and she still engages in activities related to Sámi culture.

Diversity was also shown in the Sámi “making use of” the iconic effect of their “Sáminess”, for instance using the importance of cultural tourism to justify funding requests for cultural projects such as museums (ÖP, 2001-06-15). Another article showed that it was only rational that the Sámi should take advantage of urban dwellers, who are likely escaping to Sápmi to flee their urban crisis, to promote the Sámi traditions (Miljömagasinet, 2013-03-04). Such articles show that the Sámi identity is constructed by both the dominant Swedish society and the Sámi themselves. This echoes other researchers’ findings, that there is “discursive awareness” of the significance of tourism in its role in constructing Sáminess (Viken, 2006), and that tourism can be used by Sámi individuals to achieve their own subjective goals (Keskitalo & Schilar, 2016; Niskala & Ridanpää, 2016). On the other hand, it contrasts what Pietikäinen (2003) observes about the representation of the Sámi in the national Finnish newspaper Helsingin Sanomat as a primitive and homogenous group.
Discussion and conclusion

The media coverage of Sámi tourism forms an important part of the ethno-political discourses surrounding its development, and analogous to what Müller and Pettersson (2006, p. 67) stated regarding the Jokkmokk Winter Festival, even the media form “... an arena where indigenous heritage is displayed, tested, contested, and re-negotiated ...” In this article, we conducted a discourse analysis on 165 news articles from 29 Swedish newspapers. We learn from the results that the ethno-political discourse construct and is constructed by the discursive practice of tourism in Sápmi, and is thus an ongoing dialectical process. This process entails three aspects. First, tourism in Sápmi is represented in a changing landscape of ethno-political discourses, whereby the way tourism is perceived resonates with the shifting trends and relationships in these discourses. Second, these news articles frequently demonstrate how the ethno-political discourse is intertwined in the social relations between tourism and other natural-resource-based industries. Third, the process of social identity construction is diversified for the more active and noticeable role the Sámi are playing in tourism activities.

Not least, the issue of the Sámi and tourism is debated in a Swedish context. Furthermore, the analysis indicated that the expectations regarding the development of tourism are plentiful. Not only non-Sámi stakeholders, such as the Swedish government and various industries, but also Sámi stakeholders within as well as outside the tourism industry are represented in the material studied. The results of our analysis reflect the theoretical debates on the indigeneity of Sámi tourism that assert that tourism in Swedish Sápmi is represented in nuances rather than binaries. Indeed, it is shown through the material that Sámi tourism development is a process of industrial restructuring embedded in an ethno-political discourse flavoured by a colonial past and amplifying political positions and opinions. As previous research on Sámi tourism shows, both collaborations and conflicts exist (Olsen, 2016). Still, in the Swedish case this has happened in a rather balanced way, likely indicating the rather well-off positions of the parties involved. Hence, the study does not necessarily support Weaver's (2010) idea of a quasi-empowerment.

There is obviously a heterogeneous debate that reflects modernity in itself and, moreover, tourism is by no means seen as the only option for development, by either Sámi or non-Sámi commentators. The news articles present a site of struggles for the Sámi people and their lifestyle, and tourism often plays a part in these struggles. The struggle for maintaining livelihoods sometimes competes within the same geographical domain, in an economically contested periphery of northern Europe. Often such struggles take forms of conflicts over utilities of natural resources (Olsen, 2016), and unbalanced power relations in decision-making process (Johnsen, 2016), and we suggest future studies to focus on investigating specific events through employing news articles as research material. In addition, while our research findings can be useful to understand similar issues in other Sámi areas in Norway and Finland, we suggest interested researchers to conduct separate studies for context-specific readings in the future.

There are, of course, some limitations and possibilities for future research. The representation or definition of tourism in these articles was not always clear. Sometimes different groups discussed tourism in different ways in the same piece, and sometimes people referred to different things when they actually all meant tourism. What tourism is, especially in the setting of Sámi tourism, is thus ambiguous. Food, accommodation and
guiding are generally related to tourism, but the small-scale hosting of people is sometimes regarded as a cultural activity rather than as a business. However, we suggest that this ambiguous nature of tourism might be a fruitful field for future study. For example, it might be worth knowing what factors influence different actors to understand, define and communicate the concepts of tourism differently in Sápmi and, what are the consequences of having different definitions of tourism when operating similar tourism activities in Sápmi.

Finally, the largest indigenous Sámi newspaper in Sweden, Samefolket, was not archived in the database and was therefore not included in the analysis. While we already know that even within the Sámi community there are different opinions about tourism, we still believe that the media representations of Sámi tourism in Samefolket could shed light on more “inside views” from within the Sámi groups. Therefore, we suggest that future research look at both Samefolket and other Swedish newspapers in order to identify the process of negotiation around Sámi tourism.

Notes

1. The ambiguity regarding the population of the Sámi people is noted here (see Abram, 2016).
2. We are highly aware of the colonization of the Sámi land and culture in history. The term “dialectical relationship” is not used here to diminish the struggles the Sámi groups have undergone, but to emphasize the constant negotiations carried out between the Swedish State and the Sámi groups, especially since the beginning of the twentieth century (Lantto & Mörkenstam, 2008). Another purpose of saying the relationship is dialectical is to highlight the active roles the Sámi groups are taking in the negotiation process. As Sköld (2015) has formulated earlier:

   conflicts within Sápmi receive a good deal of media coverage, but it is important to remember that cultural co-existence has in no way been entirely a matter of disagreements but has above all entailed unique forms of co-operation. This close conjunction of the cultures of northern Sweden has entailed reciprocal influence, manifested by language, culture and identity. (p. 46)

3. These articles are normally commissioned by TT, and are used in various local newspapers.
4. The “irrelevant articles” we exclude are mainly those in which there is no relationship drawn between the key words “Sámi” and “tourism”. In such cases we could not examine or analyse the material.
5. Surströmming, fermented Baltic herring, is a traditional food that originated in northern Sweden. The uniqueness of the taste and smell of surströmming is often represented in media as something strange and exotic.

Acknowledgements

We thank the anonymous reviewers who gave us very valuable comments.

Disclosure statement

No potential conflict of interest was reported by the authors.

Funding

This work was supported by the project From Reindeer Herder to Tourist Entrepreneur, funded by the Marianne and Marcus Wallenberg Foundation.
References


Saarinen, J. (2007). Tourism in peripheries: The role of tourism in regional development in northern Finland. In D. Müller, & B. Jansson (Eds.), *Tourism in peripheries: Perspectives from the far north and south* (pp. 41–52). Oxfordshire: CABI.


**Appendix. Newspaper articles**

Aftonbladet (1994-12-11) Vi måste acceptera turismen (Jan Helin).
Aftonbladet (2005-02-06) Vi kan skämmas över samernas identitetskris (Jan Helin).
AT (2011-09-02) Samesamhälle och flora i fokus på Padjelantaleden (Björn Dinau).
BT (2011-09-16) De fjällvandrade som (Christel Hofberg).
DN (1999-10-24) Vinternöjen för både gourmeter och frisksportare (Brita Svedlund).
DN (2003-12-14) Intresset ökar för samisk kultur (Brita Svedlund).
DN (2013-01-10) Den samiska kulturen är viktigare än platsen (Frida Oskarsson).
DN (2014-02-08) Sameledare anklagar Åkesson för rasbiologi (Mats Larsson).
Expressen (1990-11-10) Flyg, snabbtåg, paketresor, kasino i Kiruna, men … vill Norrbotten ha (Pia Nordström).
Expressen (1996-04-10) Renlevnadskvinnor. Maria Schottenius på tur i Sameland (Maria Schottenius).
Expressen (2007-06-06) 100 skäl att stanna i Sverige (Elisabet Axås).
GP (1995-07-02) Titta, leka, lära ”Nöjesmuseet” i Östersund är på rätt väg (Grahm Hinnfors Gunilla).
GP (2001-12-08) Jokkmokks marknad drar långväga gäster (Marie Kennedy).
HD (1998-12-24) Efter Nikka Luokta (Göran Holmquist).
HD (2006-05-08) Ta en tur för en god natur (Håkan Palm).
HN (2009-05-09) Samer flörtar med utländsk turism.
Lokaltidningen (2009-09-23) Tärnabyelever utf (Urban Viklund).
LÖ (1997-10-18) Ola Sundell vill finna balans mellan samer och markägare (Charlotta Söderhjelm).
LÖ (1997-12-24) Låt dom inte lura dig jordbruksministern (Bertil Andersson).
LÖ (1998-01-14) Renskötselstorg behövs i glesbygd (Kerstin Modin).
LÖ (1999-02-20) Republiken, lördag.
LÖ (1999-11-15) Samerna i tiden (Lars Thomasson).
LÖ (1999-11-22) Mats Ericson vill skapa en positivare bild kring rovdjurens (Stefan Persson).
LÖ (2000-01-04) Norska samer får 75 miljoner i fond (Thelma Kimsjö).
LÖ (2000-03-03) Same åtnam satsar på vilsna samer (Pål Doj).
LÖ (2000-07-12) Forskare på etour kartlägger samisk turism (Thelma Kimsjö).
LÖ (2000-09-22) Samisk turism i fokus (Elisabet Rydell-Janson).
LÖ (2000-12-21) Tourister vill möta levande samisk kultur (Thelma Kimsjö).
LÖ (2001-01-02) Renskötseln är en stor tillgång för turism (Thelma Kimsjö).
LÖ (2001-06-15) 1,2 miljoner till samiska projekt (Thelma Kimsjö).
LÖ (2008-04-04) Första mötet om vindkraft i Are lugnade många oroade ortsbor (Elisabet Rydell-Janson).
LÖ (2010-02-18) Vindkraft ofarligt för ren (Mats Tysk).
LÖ (2010-03-12) Gemensam organisation ska stärka samisk turism (Thelma Kimsjö).
LÖ (2012-10-10) Projekt ska främja samiska småföretag (Thelma Kimsjö).
LÖ (2013-11-29) Våren kom en vecka tidigare i år (Malin Moberg).
Miljömagasinet (2007-12-21) Sökarna går i samiska kulturspår (Ewa Ljungdahl).
Miljömagasinet (2011-03-04) Renässans för samiskt mathantverk (Gustaf Jilker).
MS (2008-10-22) Jokkmokk- mer än midnattssol, fjäll och renar (Per Gunne).
NH (2015-04-17) Gunilla Carresjö, Föreningen Norden (Christina Nordwall).
NK (2011-02-03) Prinsessan talade om klimatförändringar (Agneta Nyberg).
NK (2012-08-23) Trampar 400 mil för vargen (Kenth Bergmark).
NLT (2009-01-26) Vad ska du göra? (Jessica Dalman).
Nordsvenska (2015-12-30) Kombinerar kulturavt begnsnar (Sven Lindblom).
Norrlandet (2012-10-12) Samarbetet ska ge bra samisk turism (Britta Stenberg).
NS (2009-04-29) Samiskt val engagerar fåtal (Olov Abrahamsson).
NS (2012-10-12) Stor satsning på sameturism (Nils Johansson).
NT (2011-11-10) ”Jag känner mig stolt över mitt ursprung” (Mikael Grip).
Nu (2012-02-03) Sametinget blir kommun (Jan Fröman).
PT (2010-06-03) Samer föreslås få styra i Laponia.
PT (2013-11-14) Ur vårt arkiv.
Restauratören (2010-03-19) Samerna vill få kontroll över den lokala turismen med Visit Sápmi (Linda Swartz).
SD (1995-10-17) Stopp för snöskoter i flera fjäll (Susanna Baltscheffsky).
SD (2000-10-22) Nordiska rovdjur magnet för turister Ceaucescu förbjöd björnjakt (Susanna Baltscheffsky).
Smålandsposten (2013-08-23) Samer har sökt tusen jobb (Helena Söderlund).
SN (2010-07-10) Samekulturen - ekoturism som berör (Andreas Strömberg).
SN (2014-03-07) Sonja ville veta mer om sina samiska rötter (Johan Selin).
ST (2015-01-01) Kasta inte sten i glashus (Kjell Carnbro).
ST (2015-02-03) Rovdjur tar halva deras produktion (Bo Joffer).
Sydsvenskan (2007-06-20) Fler jobbar med turism (Daniel Sandström).
TT (1982-08-23) Samer.
TT (1984-02-21) Sameklipp.
TT (1985-08-27) Fjällnära.
TT Spektra (2004-02-04) Ökad framtidstro bland samer (Ove Byström).
VF (2003-02-18) Turism kan bli lönsamt för samer (Rolf Jakobsson).
VF (2006-02-15) Många i landet drabbas när renskötande samer privilegeras (Thure Lundström).
VF (2008-08-08) Nationalpark på Sorselevis (Lars Bodén).
VF (2008-09-03) En nationalpark blir till slut på statens vis (Marianne Johansson).
VF (2009-02-17) Samerbyarna slår undan benen på sig själva (Markägare).
VK (1989-02-02) 2/turist + pedagogik (Owe Eliasson).
VK (1990-08-23) Stekenjokk (Johnny-Wahlström).
VK (1993-09-08) Samegårderna passar med avfallsbeslut (Ingvar Näsland).
VK (1997-09-01) Stekenjokk invigdes (Calle Hård).
VK (1998-02-20) "Sälj jakträtt på vilda renar" (Björn Tennholt).
VK (1998-04-14) Idé om ranchdrift i renkötseln (Rolf Peter Ericson).
VK (2003-08-26) Storumans samlandet möte inför projektet om lokal förvaltning (Ingvar Näsland).
VK (2005-08-04) Rensköttillvaro på riktigt (Ingvar Näsland).
VK (2007-11-05) "23 miljoner i prisstöd enda statliga subvention" “Bra renolyckorna” (Bertholof Brännström).
VK (2008-02-12) Studie för att utveckla turism (Bertholof Brännström).
VK (2011-09-08) Den samiska färgklicken och en europeisk varbård (Kajsa Althén).
VK (2013-12-18) Smärtspåren efter Lundbohm (Sara Meldell).
Västerbottningen (2003-12-22) Samer och turism samarbetar i Ammarnäs (Eric Nordlund).
Västerbottningen (2010-04-22) Svenska turismmål ännu ingen internationell lockelse (Fredrik Bjärnesand).
ÖP (2000-09-06) Samer vädjar om betesro för renar (Patrick Rosenberg).
ÖP (2000-11-02) Hon har kartlagt turismens barndom (Stefan Nolervik).
ÖP (2001-06-15) "Länsmuseet arbetar i hela länet" (Sten Rentzhog).
ÖP (2002-03-08) Samerna och rennäringen gör vårt land intressant (Anette).
ÖP (2002-03-19) Varnar för en Disneyfiering av samekulturen (Håkan Persson).
ÖP (2002-10-18) "Viktigt att sprida kunskap och få bort fördomar" (Åsa Hansson).
ÖP (2003-01-30) "Turismen kan hjälpa samer att bo kvar" (Anders Grönlund).
ÖP (2005-02-18) Manifestation för samisk kultur i Funäsdalen (Hans Lindeberg).
ÖP (2009-08-05) Kampen mot försurningen måste bli en folkrörelse (Rikard Lindén).
ÖP (2009-08-08) Första året som landshövding (Hans Lindeberg).
ÖP (2010-02-06) Samerna är ett av världens ursprungsfolk (Hans Lindeberg).
ÖP (2010-02-11) Östersund Inspirationsdag för (Marcus Berglund).
ÖP (2011-09-03) Entreprenörerna Storsjöodjuret tar plats i IT-samhället (Hans Lindeberg).
ÖP (2014-12-16) "Visst är det obehagligt" (Maria Lindholm).