



UMEÅ UNIVERSITY

# DO 'THEY' DESERVE TO – BE SLAVES

A CASE STUDY ON MEDIA PRESENTATION OF  
BENEFIT CHEAT AND LABOR RIGHT VIOLATION  
IN SWEDEN

---

Khash-Erdene Battogtokh

Spring term 2019

## ABSTRACT

---

This paper analyses text on Swedish trade union newspaper *Arbetet* about taking advantage of immigrants of home service corporation *Enklare Vardag*.

The theoretical framework consists of theories about critical discourse analysis. The analysis is done by employing Norman Fairclough's CDA model, combined with other tools of critical linguistics.

The aim is to detect what constructs as common sense. Moreover, to define how the signifier and signified work together in the media constructed subject position of the cheater. To identify that, interviews of different groups of wardship workers speculations towards the article are included. Aside from a "cheater", understanding of common - sense ground in society and media within the field of immigration, labor's right incorporate the analysis purpose.

The chosen article is analyzed from contradicting perspectives of benefit cheat discourse that often supports with right-wing media and criticizes welfare state and on the other hand, criticism towards power relation between capitalistic oppression of the working class.

# CONTENTS

---

A case study on media presentation of benefit cheat and labor right violation in Sweden.....	1
Abstract.....	2
1 Introduction.....	5
1.1 Purpose and research questions.....	6
1.2 Background.....	7
1.2.1 <i>Arbetet</i> newspaper.....	7
1.2.2 Enklare Vardag corporation.....	7
2 Previous researches.....	9
2.1 Deciding worthiness of people.....	9
2.2 Emotions in “radicality” of the right-wing.....	10
2.3 Myths?.....	12
3 Theory and method.....	14
3.1 Hegemony and common sense.....	14
3.2 Fairclough’s researches and CDA.....	16
3.2.1 Critical Discourse analysis.....	17
3.2.2 The three - dimensional model.....	20
3.2.3 Critical linguistics.....	21
3.2.4 Discussion of method.....	22
3.3 The article and interview.....	23

4	Analysis.....	26
4.1	Textual analysis .....	28
4.2	View of ward workers.....	41
5	Conclusion .....	50
6	References.....	52

# 1 INTRODUCTION

---

Media debate on "benefit cheat" has gained new prominence in Global West. Individuals and companies who fraudulently claim benefit are embodied as the primary - focus of those debates. Such representations happen to shape the identity of undeserving others. Others as outsiders and surplus people, whose existence is needed in profit economy society, where people tend to react to differences of each other in three different ways: ignoring, copying or destroying. (Lorde. 2007). A hypothesis is born in the interpretation of previous studies that benefit cheat discourse gravitate towards provoking the *destroying* response against subordinary position of cheaters in favor of right-wing politics. Contribution to build scapegoats of modern west circulate in mass media production correspondingly. Complication understanding of scapegoat of a society is that it includes all minority groups, namely criminals, impaired people, immigrants. Alternatively, but everything which deviates from the norm.

Not only right-wing media consider benefit cheat discourse. Identity of undeserving citizen might shift from immigrants and towards capitalists if media representation of benefit cheater stands on employment right side. So far, there has been little discussion about how power relation in social classes and orientalism relate and push forward each other. When labor right "guardian" media stands for ill-treated employers of a fraudulent entrepreneur, things seem to get manifold. Response from wardship workers with both local and immigrant upbringings might help explain to shape the position of the fraudster better.

In recent past, trade union newspaper *Arbetet* and *Kommunalarbetaren* published criminal violation of human and labor rights of *Enklare Vardag corporation*. Victims of the activity were asylum seekers and Swedish citizens with an immigrant background.

## **1.1 PURPOSE AND RESEARCH QUESTIONS**

This research examines how newspaper Arbetet describes the company Enklare Vardag's activities, employees, and customers, and how the employees perceive Arbetet's description.

This research aimed to address the following research questions

- 1) How Arbetet depicts ward workers, customers, and the company?
- 2) How do ward workers perceive Arbetet's description?
- 3) What power relations and roles emerge in the article and workers' answers? Is there a difference between Swedish and immigrant workers' views?

## 1.2 BACKGROUND

Background information on study subjects: *Arbetet* newspaper and *Enklare Vardag* corporation. *Arbetet* depicted *Enklare Vardag*'s activities and their consequences on immigrant workers in the article: "*Hon har den här pyramiden där vi är slavar och hon är härskare*"

### 1.2.1 *Arbetet* newspaper

*Arbetet* is a magazine that oversees the whole labor market of the country. It targets the trade union agents, labor management, politicians, and opinion-formers. The media tool is the progeny of the Trade Union Movement issued newspaper (1921). The newspaper used to publish academical and theoretical journals with long investigative and analyzing articles. The journal was essential for the Swedish Trade and Union Confederation to highlight background materials and requirements that conducted in different discussions. In 1976, the Trade Union Confederation highlighted the journalistic mission of the newspaper, coinciding their decision to revive the paper. The journal's name changed several times until it receives the recent title: *Arbetet* in 2012. (*Arbetet*, [arbetet.se/om/](http://arbetet.se/om/)).

The reason for choosing the labor movement upheld newspaper *Arbetet* is because of the complexity of the main problems. The fact that *Arbetet* is the labor movement upheld newspaper, that stands for ordinary blue collars, might seem not to fit into benefit cheat discourse. Illustration of class struggle between employer and employee of the company on the chosen article adds multiplexity to research question. Does this kind of depiction of cheater add a layer to social prejudice against minorities, or does it help to emit those? (Waltersson et al., 2019)

### 1.2.2 *Enklare Vardag* corporation

Today's *Enklare Vardag* corporation established in 2001 with the former title: *Nursing Pool*. The company changed its policy in 2007 from renting out nurses to home service, escorting, and personal care assistance services.

In 2019 the business widened into the employer of about a hundred and sixty employees. The company has three main offices and runs in five municipalities around and including Stockholm. According to the own source, *Enklare Vardag* assigned the highest creditworthiness for seven years in a row. It started implementing the collective agreement and shows the high quality of external customer surveys. ([Enklarevardag.se](http://enklarevardag.se), 2019)

The Swedish 7<sup>th</sup> biggest (Arbetet. 2019) home care service company: *Enklare Vardag (Easier weekday)* was accused of taking advantage of immigrant workers, paying them too low salary compared to their on-duty hours. Foreign employers who had to stay employed for at least four years in Sweden to get the employment right in Sweden, claims that they had no choice, but to accept the poor treatment of their employee. They were working under threat for being "thrown" out of the country, in case they would not give back a certain amount of their low salaries. The case is mostly published in the journals: *Arbetet* and *AK*. There are several connected articles around the case. The article that this paper analyses here: "Hon har den här pyramiden där vi är slavar och hon är härskare". (Arbetet. No.8, 2019)

## 2 PREVIOUS RESEARCHES

---

### 2.1 DECIDING WORTHINESS OF PEOPLE

There is several studies have been made on benefit cheat representation on mass media. Previous literature discussed in this chapter is employed as support for the analysis of this paper. Earlier studies on benefit cheat have concentrated on neoliberal politics right-wing media's framing processes of social minorities and welfare state. (Lundström, 2013; Hughes, 2015; Libby and Byrne, 2014).

There have been numerous studies to investigate the media representation on benefit cheat. Original works in this field have been primarily focusing on the neoliberal political attempt to disapprove the general aim and purpose of the welfare state (Lundström, 2013). This purpose is seen to be achieved by employing right-wing media representations of benefit cheat. The idea of deservingness plays a significant role in those presentations. Deservingness is the major factor in understanding political factors towards the benefits system (Geiger. 2012). Among these, most widely used types-of understanding of "undeserving," the object of accusation manifest itself as 'those' groups of disabled people, fraudulent benefit takers, and even immigrants indeed. On this ground, it awakens great curiosity and complexity to pay a close look into *Arbetet* newspaper which is – in my understanding, contemplated to be "a guardian for ordinary workers."

Western media, especially British and Swedish media representations are different but similar by the way that, in both countries' welfare state and the citizens traditionally have been constructed in liberal and social democratic contexts respectively. (Lundström, 2013). Lundström's study argues that political attempts to highlight the issue of benefit fraud using dominant media representations must, therefore, be understood not as attempts to combat fraud, but rather as attempts to delegitimize the more general aim and purpose of the welfare state. He means that those kinds of representations on benefit cheater challenge the deservingness of welfare recipients in general, not just the ones that misuse the welfare system. So they thereby transform the conditions for public trust in the welfare state. (Lundström 2013) He suggests that even though fraudulent focused texts don't necessarily define cheating as standard practice, or state that all benefit claims are illegitimate, it is not uncommon that they articulate the subject of the cheater using collective terms. (Ibid)

Similarly, McEnhill. L and Byrne V. (2014) case study on *Sun* newspaper's articles about benefit cheat points out the notion tendency to claim undeserving others. The study employs theories on media influence on public opinion and explains different alignments of the social model of disability and individual model of disability. The research study puts a strong moral focus on the newspaper's way of

representation. *Sun* appeared to claim that the majority of benefit claimants as undeserving the support. McEnhill. L and Byrne V. underlined as well, the fact that the newspaper journalists have been disproportionately covering disability benefit fraud relative to other types of fraud. Generalizations drawn from individual cases of fraud was brought to attention by the researchers as well. (McEnhill. L and Byrne V., 2014:1). This suggestion of common moral issues such as generalization in media texts seems to be useful to keep in mind when one analysis texts even though this paper concentrate mostly on discourse practices and integration/immigration-related common sense.

The idea of benefit fraud is increasingly depicted in contemporary western world's right-wing mass media. For instance, in the UK: "The Welfare Reform Act (2012) brought about changes to benefit entitlement and assessment for disabled people, with measures to reduce the budget in this area justified within parts of the Conservative party and right-wing media through the use of narratives of deserving and undeserving citizens." (McEnhill, Byrne. 2014) According to Lundström 1996, both in international social policy discourse and among welfare researchers, Sweden has-along with the other Nordic countries traditionally been viewed as something close to the ideal of the institutionally redistributive welfare state. That is, as adhering to a welfare model with a relatively high degree of equality and well-developed welfare structures such as national social insurance, health care, and education. (Lundström, 1996)

Nevertheless, today, benefit fraud constitutes a highly pervasive dimension of welfare policy debates in Sweden (Johnson, 2010). Traditionally, images of cheating were only rarely invoked, but since the early 1990s, this has changed, and images of fraud have become very common in Sweden (Svallfors, 1996; Lundström, 2011b). Research has indicated that this focus is intimately linked to the redistributive scope of the liberal welfare state, and to how social citizenship is constructed (Van Oorschot, 2000). It is believed that by employing strategies through which welfare dependency is articulated as representative of an undeserving form of citizenship, neoliberal welfare discourse legitimizes its own particular form of governmentalism and the implementation of welfare policies marked by workfare ethics and stricter control (Brush, 1997; Chunn and Gavigan, 2004; Fraser, 2003; Fraser and Gordon, 1994). This paper takes into consideration question on orientalism as well, even within media production for the "subaltern" group in Sweden.

## **2.2 EMOTIONS IN “RADICALITY” OF THE RIGHT-WING**

Several studies have shown that right-wing media representations on benefit cheaters tend to evoke or dwell on general bitterness of dominant members of contemporary western society. That bitter feeling tends to be expressed as blame towards the group of "others," including disabled people, in the media

representations of benefit fraud. 'Emotions' have been a 'sticking point' for philosophers, cultural theorists, psychologists, sociologists, as well as scholars from a range of other disciplines. (Ahmed, S., 2013:4). Lundström's study indicates that in benefit fraud articles, there is a clear symbolic distinction between one specific group of citizens, articulated as illegitimate and undeserving, i.e., immigrants, and other citizens. (Lundström 2013:642). He concludes that those types of texts do not attempt to beat fraud, but attack welfare state and recipients of liberal welfare to delegitimize the more general aim and purpose of the welfare state.

As mentioned before, these texts also attempt to transform the conditions for public trust in the welfare state. He observed a similar pattern in UK and Swedish newspaper and blog discourse that constructs the undeserving group of benefit recipients, including disability, unemployment, and immigrants, blaming the welfare system that 'enables' those "groups" to "thrive" (Lundström 2013). Lundström's analysis seems to be realistic.

Being mentioned about blame, Hughes (2015) illustrates the process of politics of hospitality turning into politics of resentment. He adopts Emmanuel Kant's argument that cosmopolitan hospitality was a preparatory phase to contemporary resentment society in the West. The transformation from hospitality to resentment started when the construction of the welfare state begins to crumble in the UK in the 1970s with the rise of neoliberal 'new right' and their proposal of 'survival of the fittest' started work. He argues that the politics of the resentment is the declaration of cultural insularity with many dimensions. In his article, he "aligns resentment with contemporary neoliberal populism and its identification of the oppressed, in general: as an intersectional scrum of disabled, homeless, Romas, immigrants, asylum seekers, refugees, black and ethnic minority groups, so-called 'chavs' and other people who live on the margins." (Hughes 2015:4). He draws three major media representation types of those "scapegoats" as "pejorative depiction of idleness, dependency, fickleness and fraudulent claims of collective coffers." He means that "mediatized promotion of bitterness against the 'have-nots'" is the journey to 'hygienic governmentality,' which is ableism, that has embodied, in different forms, the mobilization of a politics of resentment that constructs disability as a "scapegoat."

Similarly speaking, mentioned previous studies point out modern western media's way of reflecting conservative party ableism. Also, they use the benefit cheat field to separate impairment members of society. Being impaired in the modern West is to be one of the minority groups.

Speaking of blame, it seems worth mentioning that social psychology patterns, illustrated in earlier studies, remind us about "shame studies." It is believed that blaming, and finger-pointing is one of many ways of avoiding each one's "inherent" feeling of shame (personal interpretation of Brené Brown 2012).

Brown argues that shame and courage have the same root, which is a vulnerability. In her theory, most individuals unconsciously choose emotion of blame as a shield for shame. She strikingly concludes that to overcome shame, one should return to vulnerability, which is the birthplace of courage, inspiration, love as well. Unfortunately, the main - focus of this paper is on power relations between discourses and entrenched common sense behind the given article.

Whatsoever, moving on: Swedish media, on the other hand, respects the identity of the cheater, compared to the UK argues Lundström (2013), but still creates a strong ground to the collective awareness against Scandinavian Universalism, which is governed in that case by Social Democrats, by alarming citizens. Correspondingly, the research suggests that too much concentration on the financial loss of benefit cheat representations blur the links between benefit programs, the purpose of the programs and needs of those they are intended. (Lundström 637). It is a useful point to reflect on.

The studies presented so far suggest that media presentation on benefit fraud in the western world have been based on neoliberal politics idea of "survival of the fittest," usually using the right-wing press as a medium of the message. It seems to be a strong point, along with this, emotions of resentment and bitterness drive the idea of neoliberal politics, seems authentically captivating. This idea appealingly corresponds with Sarah Ahmed (2014)'s analysis on "public domain texts, which work by aligning subjects with collectives by attributing 'others' as the 'source' of article our feelings." She means:

*"We/Us" in those texts addresses Aryan people, who are vulnerable and in need to protect their nation from "others." "Indeed, to feel love for the nation, whereby love is an investment that should be returned (you are 'the taxpayer'), is also to feel injured by these others, who are 'taking' what is yours."*

*(Sarah Ahmed. 2014:1).*

## **2.3 MYTHS?**

However other observations, such as *Center for Analysis of Social Exclusion in the UK* argues that widespread assumption of increasing negative public attitudes to the western benefits system is due to 'myths' held by the British public. Those myths cannot be justified so that there is a little prior research on whether the public believes these 'myths,' nor critical scrutiny of benefit 'truth.' (Geiger, B.B., 2018: 52(5), pp.998-1018). Therefore, this paper deals with interviews from wardship workers. Interview from both immigrant and local Swedish wardship workers for their interpretation of the given ideologically complex news article might contribute to discovering whether readers believe these myths.



### 3 THEORY AND METHOD

---

This paper adopts critical discourse analysis, CDA of Norman Fairclough. Three - dimensional model is employed with Fairclough constructive adaptation of the Gramscian notion of common sense is used. Additionally, Fowler's linguistic tools are applied.

Linguistic analyses of media text became increasingly influential since 1980. They have been useful in unpacking facets of the media text structures and in attempting to trace social conceptions, values, identities, and relationships. Application of linguistic analysis in media texts is proven to be an essential way to reveal how relations of power and authority in society is embodied in media texts. (Deacon, D., Pickering, M., Golding, P. and Murdock, G., 1999:150)

The term "discourse" is defined in different ways, yet shares vital concerns, such as with the use of the language in social life and the relationship between language use and social structure. This concern on the relationship between language and social structure is deepened by the influence of the French philosopher Michel Foucault (1926-84). Foucault sees that social relations of power and knowledge are reflected in language formation. This understanding of "discourse" is usually implied in contemporary linguistic studies. Foucault sometimes referred to a discursive formation as authoritative and bearing the interest of existing authority, which can be understood as 'ideology.' Similarly to this, Fowler defines 'discourse' as a speech which is written from the beliefs, values, and categories, that neutrally embodies "ideology". This way, the discourse invisibly exclude other perspectives (Deacon, D., Pickering, M., Golding, P. and Murdock, G., 1999:151, 152).

#### 3.1 HEGEMONY AND COMMON SENSE

'Common sense' assumptions have been an important focus of critical linguistics and critical discourse analysis. Fairclough puts particular emphasis on 'common - sense' assumptions in his language studies. In his words, these assumptions are taken for granted in people's language use, without their conscious attention. These are constructed by social ideologies which are closely linked to power relations. Because ideological implications are according to Fairclough are embedded in particular conventions. Power relations underline those conventions in its turn. These power relations are means or legitimizing existing social relations of the power difference. Those differences consist in society by standard, repetitive practices of its members. (Fairclough, N., 2001:2)

In the past media was described being as if they were dominated by stable unitary practices imposed from above. It implies in *code model* of the media order of discourse. This model considered being

inadequate in contemporary media. Because modern media stresses cultural diversity and practices high plurality. To enable arising of questions of power and domination in media texts, approaching the domination order of diversity in media is crucial. This thesis slightly converges on Gramsci's concept of *hegemony* as a theory of power and domination, which emphasizes power through achieving consent rather than coercion. In Gramscian manner, common sense is addressed as "philosophy of the non-philosophers.... the conception of the world which is uncritically absorbed by the various social and cultural environments in which...the average man is developed" (Gramsci, 1971). Why "philosophy of non-philosophers" is essential?

Gramsci articulates a multiplicity of common senses that co-occur within the same society. However, this multiplicity of common senses always leaves the whole of the working class, which Gramsci terms the "subaltern," as casualties of the non-philosophers philosophy. The Gramscian notion on common sense suggests that this multitude of common sense is "diffuse," "un-coordinated." It is described that the bourgeois delivers diffuseness of that multitude common sense on purpose. The result is the "subaltern" classes in this manner resorts to "spontaneous" methods of action based on what is thought to be "instinct," although it is actually "... the primitive and elementary historical acquisition" (Gramsci, 1971). Gramsci views that "in normal times," times outside of economic or political crisis, the subaltern has a proclivity for adopting the viewpoint of their perceived superiors. Their strong powers of negation and criticism are buried beneath the desire for "normalcy."

Thus, hypothetically, common sense is shaped by visible and mostly invisible ideological assumptions. It might be understood as the power relations underlining individual and group of people, that happens layers within layers. It also can be described as a plant that grows on unconscious duality soil in every individual; which makes them both manufacturer of common sense and accessible parts to be regulated by the state. It is, therefore, important to study public common sense in decoding of media texts to understand the relationship between the state and public discourse within various related groups.

Discourses in media texts links with sociocultural discourses, originating discourse practices that are concerned with how media workers produce texts in media institutions and how texts are received by the audience. Fairclough employs Halliday (1978) view of texts which suggests that 'ideational', 'interpersonal' and 'textual' functions of language are always simultaneously at work within any text, and even in particular sentence or clause, makes it easier to connect the analysis of language with fundamental concerns of social analysis: question of knowledge, belief and ideology, questions of social relationships, power and identity. (Fairclough 1995:17). Here, one cannot fail to recognize the phenomenon of *common sense* is an essential factor in this paper.

Pursuing Fairclough's constructive adoption of Gramsci's notion of common sense, this thesis focuses on determining relations between ideological processes and linguistic processes in discourse. Hegemony practice (Forgacs 1988, Gramsci 1971) of different discourses and their relationship to each other were synthesized using the same method Norman Fairclough proceed in *Crimewatch UK* analysis. Fairclough concludes that there is a link between the program and the sociocultural practices, in this case, which reflects "fraught relationship between the state and people." (Fairclough 1995:167). Likewise, Stuart Hall holds the view that "When a message is emitted it is not only what is said that has a significant but also the way it is said, and what is not said but could be said." (1980:112). "The media order of discourse can, I think, usefully be examined as a domain of cultural power and hegemony" (Fairclough p.67)

In Gramscian manner, "unconsciously" constructed common sense then reproduces meaning within language. Meaning-making relies on two different but related systems of representation: *concepts* and *language*. (Stuart Hall, Gramsci). From this point, it seems important to look at the direction of that already switched light towards this unconscious mechanism and see how it functions, in pursuance of clearer sight in further steps.

Analysing a news article conveying the idea of two different but related system of representation, and the idea of hegemonic construction in discourse of a text, this paper seeks to spot a potential tension between state and population, immigrants and taxpayers and other available socio-cultural discourses, as a result of "identifying" their social stand, "voices", "genres" in the media text. (Fairclough 1995) A full discussion of benefit fraud or an immigration employment discourse lies beyond the scope of this study. Due to practical constraints, this paper cannot provide a comprehensive review of overall Swedish mass media representation on benefit cheat or sociocultural discourse practice

### **3.2 FAIRCLOUGH'S RESEARCHES AND CDA**

Some media analysis conducted by Fairclough including *High Resolution*, *Medicine now*, *Oprah Winfrey show*, *Medicine today*, *Crimewatch UK* indicates the importance of media, especially television on forming identity and social relations, power relations between different socio-cultural discourses. Above all, this paper attends to pursue critical steps of his analysis on tv program *Crimewatch UK*. Reason for that is it ponders upon the uniquely influential and formative position of the media in contemporary society. General understanding of relations of power and constructed in the media between audiences and those who dominate the economy, politics, and culture. (Fairclough 1995:126). Adopting this viewpoint, analysis given applies multiple analysis on the linguistic discourse of the text.

To determine the effects of discourse practice in a media text, Fairclough pays a close look at the construction of identities and the construction of relations. (Ibid). In his analysis on identity and social relations in media Fairclough emphasizes diversity, multiplicity, and variability of identities in media. According to him, there is a division of labor between newsreaders, reporters, and correspondents in news programs, with different constructions of identity and different relationships with the audience or other participants. Additionally, a single participant may have a complex identity in the sense that he or she may individually be having to leap over several activities successively or simultaneously within a media product or text. But even a single activity may involve a multiplicity of simultaneous social purposes, that implies complex and potentially contradictory identities and relations. For instance, with the help of establishing identities and their relationship, Fairclough achieves an impressive result, in the case of his analysis on *Crimewatch UK* and *999*. He evaluates that what is going on in both programs is intervention to shore up the crumbling public legitimacy of the state. (Fairclough 1995: Ch.7). This result hypothetically coincides with this paper.

Given all that has been mentioned in previous research chapter, one may suppose media discourse on a benefits cheats in a contemporary western society gravitate towards kindling ideology of "us"- in the form of different identities, depending on the given common sense, against "those" who want to take ours. It seems like "finger-pointing" plays a role in the agitator of these kinds of discourse. For instance, "us" can be taxpayers, native citizens, honest workers, employees against, "those takers" such as benefit cheaters, advantage taking CEOs of the company, immigrants along with others. In earlier studies, it is suggested that ideology is a system of representations, but in the majority of cases these representations are 'unconscious': they are usually images and occasionally concepts, but it is above all as structures that they impose on the vast majority of mass not via their 'consciousness.'"

### **3.2.1 Critical Discourse analysis**

It was decided that the best method to adopt for this study is to apply the Norman Fairclough model, considering the number of attractive features. Fairclough holds the view that: CDA is concerned with how power is exercised through language. CDA is an interdisciplinary approach to the study of discourse that views language as a form of social practice. Norman Fairclough assumes that any case of language is a communicative event. In his view, our opinions get created, and our attitudes are characterized by language. Texts have causal effects, and they bring about changes as elements of social events (Fairclough 1995: 55,56). Fairclough means that one of the causal effects of texts which have been of significant concern for critical discourse analysis is ideological effects -- the effects of texts in inculcating and sustaining or changing ideologies. The ideologies as parts of a common-sense

assumption, the connection between the use of language and the exercise of power are not often clear to people. That is why it is essential to view language as a *discourse*, seeing language as a socially shaped, but also socially shaping. Critical discourse analysis explores the tension between these two sides of language use, rather than opting one-sidedly for one or the other. To explore the twin-sided tension in the given sample, this paper leans in Fairclough's definition of language use - any text - is always simultaneously constitutive of social identities, social relations and systems of knowledge and belief. Every text makes its contribution to shaping these aspects of society and culture.

Fairclough's analytical approach assumes that language helps create change; thereupon can be used to change behavior. Language becomes a powerful tool. That is what is meant by Discourse Analysis. Fairclough, (1995) shows how we can use discourse analysis to improve this general issue by focusing upon the nature of the discourse practice in the news, looking on how genres, voices, and discourses are articulated together.

Deacon et al. (2007) literature is used for detailed discourse analysis of the given text. Fairclough model of Critical discourse analysis approaches the discursive practice of a community - its usual ways of using language in terms of language. This approach is referred to as "order of discourses", and it is employed as a tool for identifying relationships and boundaries between text discursive types. For example, in this paper analysis, there are several groups of discursive types such as state, immigrant, workers, employers, taxpayers, disabled people, and others. Distinguishing relationships between those different sets helps us to identify sociocultural power relationship reflected in the given text. Fairclough means that social and cultural changes mostly manifest themselves discursively through a boundary redrawing, for example, within and between orders of discourse. (Fairclough 1995). Multifunctional view of texts that sees the text as having three main functions: ideational, interpersonal, and textual (Halliday 1970, 1973). According to Fairclough. This multifunctional usage of discourse allows us to analyze the simultaneous constitution of systems of knowledge and belief (ideational function) and social relations and social identities (interpersonal function) in texts. (Fairclough 1995a: 58).

A *thematic structure* is a preoccupying conception or proposition which runs throughout a media text, usually around an initiating topic. (Deacon et al., 2007:174). A thematic structure helps to make a media text cohere, and it orients a text around a central theme or strand of related themes running through a story. (Ibid) The thematic structure functions are to "give a sense of overall organization", "hierarchy," and "relation" between different aspects of the properties of the text and different units of the texts. (Ibid). In this section, the spotlight is on the organization, hierarchy, and inner relationship of the text. For a reason, that thematic structures are inked linguistically with discourse schemas (Deacon et al. 2007:174).

Sequencing structure is seen to understand how discourses in the text are ordered hierarchically to define the sociocultural ideation. (Deacon et al.:2007:175)

Source quantity and quality is taken into consideration. It helps to see the balance between sources and their quality and how they are discussed in the text's framing procedure. (Ibid.)

The main categories of discourse types that constitute the order of discourse are distinguished by Fairclough as genres and discourses. (Fairclough 1995:56). Social discourses that are discussed in the text are brought into the light to see the power relation between them. (Deacon et.al)

To understand *Arbetet* newspaper's intention, what values, attitudes, and ideologies the print holds through reports on *Enklare Vardag corp.*'s case, Fairclough's critical discourse analyses are important. CDA proceeds not only media discourse effect on the audience but as well as audience perception. As known in media studies, behaviorist emphases of previous research approaches, models of direct influence, defining media as a major cultural and ideological course, was broken in the 1970s. Thus, this paper employs CDA in a twain way, one which is to emphasize intended 'message' of the given article, the other is to contemplate power and domination practices, the interrelationship of discourses that are assigned in the article. To understand the distinction between ideologies, values of ward workers in their 'decoding' of the message, two groups of subject interviewed. Namely, wardship workers who are native Swedes and emigrate counterparts.

Understanding Encoding and decoding (Stuart Hall) functions of media discourse are essential to understand the mechanisms of media representation and its effects better. The practice of encoding and decoding of media discourse draws our attention to `production/circulation` resemblance of media discourse. Stuart Hall introduced the idea of *the discursive* form that the circulation of the product takes place, as well as its distribution to different audiences. Once accomplished, the discourse must then be translated—transformed, again—into social practices if the circuit is to be both completed and effective. If no 'meaning' is taken, there can be no 'consumption.' If the meaning is not articulated in practice, it does not affect. (Hall 1980:117).

The analysis of text proceeds with Critical Discourse analysis. CDA is not interested in investigating a linguistic unit per se but in studying social phenomena which are necessarily involved and thus require a multidisciplinary and multi-methodical approach. The terms Critical Linguistics (CL) and Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) are often used interchangeably. (Wodak 2009:1) Critical linguistic tools are applied in the textual dimension of the analysis.

What is critical about Critical Discourse Analysis? The objects under investigation do not have to be related to negative or exceptionally 'serious' social or political experiences or events – this is a frequent misunderstanding of the aims and goals of CDA and of the term 'critical' which, of course, does not mean 'negative' as in common-sense usage." CDA has never been and has never attempted to be or to provide one single or specific theory. Neither is one specific methodology characteristic of research in CDA. The definitions of the terms 'discourse', 'critical,' 'ideology,' 'power,' and so on are also manifold. Thus, it is advised that any criticism of CDA should always specify which research or researcher they relate too. (Wodak 2008:5)

### **3.2.1.1 Discussion on CDA**

While some scholars suggest that Critical discourse analysis is close to becoming “an intellectual orthodoxy” (Billig 2002: 4), several critics, including Hammersley (1997:237-248) accuse Fairclough and others of asserting the need for critical approach as if this were quite obvious and unproblematic. Hammersley suggests that Marxist theory is discredited and then argues that criticizes Frankfurt school's inhuman rationalization. Frankfurt School has claimed to provide immediate antecedents for CDA. Hammersley critic in his last analysis suggests that leveled at ambitious claims made by CDA practitioners to offer a comprehensive understanding of society as a whole and how it functions, which is "superior" to other positions precisely because it is conducted in a spirit of self-reflexive critique. (1997:244-5). It is advised that CDA specialists need to pay special attention to those aspects of the epistemological underpinning of their work, and its methodological implication. (Breeze 2011: 498) The other limitations of textual analysis are described as methodologically opaque, imaginative, text objectifying. For example, it is doubtful, how far the predominantly syntactical form of analysis in the critical linguistics of Fowler et al. (1979) can adequately explain the social relations of power which language incorporates and generates. Also, from a feministic perspective how Fairclough "sees various social differentiation, primarily in terms of class structure, "may seem to exaggerate the pervasive scope of one particular type of power relation" (Barett 1980: ch.4. Deacon et al. 2007:157). However, it is not to suggest that thoroughly grounded approach can be ruled out; nor does the Western rationality pushes such analysis to impossible complexity.

### **3.2.2 The three - dimensional model**

Fairclough's has developed a threefold process of analyses. This model helps to constructively analyze through layers and discover the ideological value in the core of the text. It sees a text at different levels. In this model, they called: "dimensions". The three dimensions may be summarised as follows: The first dimension is termed *text*. Here, the analysis takes place at the next level. Text can be writing,

images, speech, or a mixture of three forms of communication. This paper uses the linguistic tools of Fowler to analyze this layer of the given text.

The second dimension is called *discursive practice*. The discursive practice involves the production of texts or constitution of texts. In this stage, to identify audience decoding of the message, voices and their intertextual relationship, the analysis simultaneously looks closely at the elements in the structure of the article, proceed analyses on genres, identify voices/sources, discourse practices as previously reported.

The third and last dimension is *social practice* or *sociocultural practices*. Here the paper analyses how the discourses connect with benefit cheat, labor, and immigration right debate.

### **3.2.3 Critical linguistics**

“Language is a part of society; linguistic phenomena are social phenomena of a special sort, and social phenomena are (in part) linguistic phenomena.” (Fairclough, N., 2001: 23).

Critical linguistic theorists, Fowler and his erstwhile associates (1979) sees linguistic patterning of texts and utterances as indelibly social, regarding how the texts are expressed. Fowler and others viewed that the expression and style of the media language cannot be separated from society's influence upon making the meaning. As well as the individual's communicative competence in a variety of social situations and contexts cannot be separated from the expression style. This way, critical linguistic tools are relevant to Fairclough's critical discourse analysis. Fairclough defines discourse analyses as an attempt to show the systematic links between texts, discourse practices, and sociocultural practices. (quoted in Deacon, D., Pickering, M., Golding, P. and Murdock, G., 1999:152 - 153)

Fowler argues that texts and ideas are not cannot be transmitted neutrally. Because when they get transmitted through a medium, they will have to have their structural features. So these features are already impregnated with social values. Critical linguistics means an inquiry into the relations between signs, meanings, and the social and historical conditions which govern the semiotic structure of discourse, using particular kind of linguistic analysis. It means that critical linguistic aim to reveal taken for granted values and ideologies in discourses. (Fowler 1991: 25, 5, 67). It is concerned with how speaking and writing encode relations of power, authority, and status in the naturalization of common-sense assumption. (Deacon, D., Pickering, M., Golding, P. and Murdock, G., 1999:152 - 154) Critical linguistics seeks, to display to the mind patterns of beliefs and value which are encoded in language by studying linguistic structures. (Fowler 1991: 67). Fowler et al. tended to concentrate on how the

generation of social meanings is conditioned by the syntactic choices, which are made in the formulation of written (or spoken) communication. (Deacon, D., Pickering, M., Golding, P. and Murdock, G., 1999: 154)

Metaphor and metonymy often work simultaneously, yet metaphor is paradigmatic, while metonymy is syntagmatic. Metaphor is dependent on opposition, while metonymy involves collective identities. Both equivalence figures. Metaphorical speech or imagery transposes one object into another. While a metonymy is a figure of speech in which a part or attribute of one thing is applied to the whole thing. (Deacon, D., Pickering, M., Golding, P. and Murdock, G., 1999:147, 148)

Transitivity is the part of the ideational function of the language. There are many different meanings behind transitivity. It gives freedom to analyze the same event in different ways. It allows the media always to suppress some possibilities of presentation and bring upfront other. That preferred option bears the ideological significance of the presenter. (Fowler. 1991:70-71) How the *Enklare Vardag* company is depicted and what is the ideology of the journalists of the objectified article can be carved out applying this tool of critical linguistics. As well as in seeing what is being said and left out, ideologies and values of workers of the company should be understandable.

Modality is used to analyze interpersonal relationships in media texts. It can be regarded as a comment or attitude of the source by his/her way to write. There are four types of comments can be distinguished by modality, which is called in plain terms: truth, obligation, permission, and desirability. Truth: writer indicates truth, the likelihood of event or situation. Obligation: the author claims that the depicted party should or must do something. Permission: Author permits by his language to readers or illustrated parties. Desirability the presenter or author approves or disapproves the state of affairs. (Fowler: 1991:86, 87). It is a useful tool to identify how journalists relate to the cheater of the state benefit, the CEO of the *Enklare Vardag*, how they relate to ill-treated party and immigrants in general. It can help to identify whether there is a hidden prejudice in media towards immigrants, where they appear to stand on their side. Alternatively, it might be a question whether this certain article is contributing to eliminating the prejudice on the contrary.

### **3.2.4 Discussion of method**

The author of this thesis has had the opportunity to learn Swedish only after becoming an adult. English neither is her mother tongue, except she was fortunate enough to learn this quite early. Thus, language might have been a limitation and a challenge in conducting this thesis. Plus, the study object is an article

that is written in Swedish, which has been translated into English. Interview part with ward workers follows the same pattern of language translation.

It should be noted that depending on how the Swedish text was translated into English, linguistic tools such as transitivity, that concentrate on minute details of a text can result from falsity. It is also concerning that Swedish and English are different languages derive from entirely different cultures. Thus, the value and ideology of the righter and interviewees can differ significantly. For that reason, transitivity is applied with great carefulness on only significant parts of the text such as headline and most important sentences.

The article was removed from Retriever media base and replaced by source, with the more detailed article with a different title, later this year. The new title is *Avslöjande: Slavliknande villkor på short hemtjänstföretag*. The transitivity analysis is applied to the news headline as well. However, further analysis is made on the first version of the text: *Hon har den här pyramiden där vi är slavar och hon härskare*. The reason is that there is a great deal of intertextual similarity. Time and scope of the analysis allowed only to continue conduction of analysis on the first version of the article.

Being an immigrant herself, since 2014, might be both weakness and strength in conducting this paper. Weakness, in a way that she might have concentrated on orientalism in Swedish media representation a bit exceptionally. Also, a lack of personal experience as a Swedish born citizen might have caused a weak point of view from a Swedish perspective. Strength, in a way which the study branch has many immigrant workers — that way, this paper might have seen from immigrant's point of view in a relatable way. Additionally, how disability-related topics are represented in media is personally relevant to the author as the mother of a child with additional needs.

### **3.3 THE ARTICLE AND INTERVIEW**

The empirical material of this work consists of one article on *Arbetet* newspaper. The article is called: *Hon har den här pyramiden där vi är slavar och hon är härskare*. The reason for choosing this article lies in the complexity of ideological entanglement this article bears. In one hand, the article is about benefit cheat. As it has been discussed in previous researches section, benefit cheat studies usually concentrate on right-wing media promotion and orientalism of minorities. On the other hand, *Arbetet* is a trade movement founded a newspaper, which stands for ordinary worker's and their right.

The reason for choosing only one article might consider as a weakness. Given the time and scope of research, analyses is made on only one article. On the other hand, ideology complexity of the article

provides sufficiency of understanding and challenge. CDA is applied first in analyzing the article. The article was given to several wardship workers to read and answer written open questions.

Interview from ward workers might complement the result in as another side of a puzzle. Six interviewees, three of whom are Swedish and three of whom are immigrants were chosen for two reasons. The first reason is that this paper wanted to see if there is a difference in views on that subject between Swedish and immigrant workers of this field. Secondly, the paper aimed which ideology bundle of common sense dominates in Swedish ward workers when it comes to media representation on benefit cheat and labor rights.

Written open questions in Swedish was given to volunteering wardship workers on their lunch break at the school for children with additional needs in Örnköldsvik city. Question conduction was decided beforehand with the agreement and permission of the wardship workers who were working on that day at the work position. There were six workers at the workplace; two of them could not participate for separate reasons. Another two participants answered the same questions a different day at their apartment in Örnköldsvik. Six volunteers were common in their job at wardship sector. They differed in occupation and ethnic background. One of them was a special needs teacher, two of them were a student - assistants, one personal care assistants, and two of them were home service and elderly accommodation employees. Three of all interviewees were born and raised in Sweden, and three of them have immigrated to Sweden in at different years. Selection of the interviewees was made based mainly on their occupation as wardship workers. It was decided to interview both native Swedish and foreign wardship employees for understanding if there is any difference in their view on benefit cheat and labor right violation discourse. Within the given time and scope of this analysis, three interviewees of each ethnical background were interviewed.

Open questions were chosen to be written in Swedish to enhance the clarity of understanding of the inquiry process for the interviewees. Article copies and question form were delivered to the interviewees in a written form to avoid risks of possible mistakes caused by transcription. However, there was a transcription made with the request of one wardship worker. Yet, the written method has its perks such as lack of discussion or possibility for follow up questions. Yet discussion happened after the interview, some parts of which were additionally noted in the written form.

Each individual was given a generous amount of time to proceed. However, as a result, the average period turned out to be 30 - 40 minutes. Every participant was asked to answer questions on the form of the given article. They were explicitly asked to be as honest as possible, as emotional as possible in answers.

As mentioned before, interview sampling from separate groups and underlining their difference is to see if there is any difference in message decoding, depending on cultural diversity. Each participant received a form with the same questions written in Swedish: *Who is the victim of this situation in the article? Which problems arise in your mind regarding the reading? Is there any falsified part? If so, who you see to be faulty in the situation?*

Before commencing the interviews, ethical clearance was sought from "Research ethical principles in humanity and social science studies" (2002). The four basic principles of research individuality advocacy are considerably followed. Those principles would be informing principle, agreement principle, confidentiality principle, and usefulness principle. (Vetenskapsrådet. 2002)

## 4 ANALYSIS

---

The text that this paper analysis is a news article about benefit and labor right violation of home service company *Enklare Vardag*. Given article is appeared in the *Arbetet* and *Kommunalarbetaren* in march 2019.



**Jag har ingen kraft kvar.**  
Kvinnan som sitter mitt emot oss i köket i en lägenhet i Stockholmsområdet har mörka ringar under ögonen. Just i dag har hon "bara" jobbat elva timmar i hemtjänsten, men andra dagar kan det bli mer. Hon berättar om månader när hon arbetat 250 timmar, hur hon inte hinner träffa sin familj, inte har några raster och inte hinner gå på toaletten. Men det är inte bara det – trots slitet tjänar hon mindre än en heltidslön.  
- Jag jobbade från klockan sju på morgonen till halv elva på kvällen och min lön var bara 11 000 kronor. Jag har ingen ob, ingen semester, jag jobbade nätter, kvällar, lördagar och söndagar, berättar hon.  
Hon visar upp ett lönebesked där hon tjänat 14 000 kronor föregående – samtidigt som hon arbetat 260 timmar den månaden. Det ger en timlön på knappt 54 kronor, vilket är 51 kronor mindre än lägsta lönen i kollektivavtalet.  
**Hon är inte ensam.** Runt köksbordet sitter flera som arbetar eller har arbetat på hemtjänstföretaget Enklare Vardag. De kommer alla från Iran och flera av dem har kommit till Sverige med hjälp av arbetstillstånd knutna till företaget. De berättar hur de arbetar betydligt mer än vad lagen tillåter och för mycket låga löner. En person med insyn i företagets administration ger exempel på en anställd som arbetade 250 timmar en månad men bara fick betalt för 160 timmar.  
- Jag jobbar sju dagar i veckan, min familj säger att jag aldrig är hemma. Jag jobbar varje dag till sent, berättar en av de anställda.  
**UTNYTTJAR PERSONALEN**  
**Enklare Vardag är ett stort företag.** I Stockholms stad har de sjunde störst omsättning bland hemtjänstföretagen, bakom jättar som Attendo. De har avtal med sju kommuner i Stockholmsområdet och hade i december förra året totalt 202 kunder.  
Vi har pratat med nio personer som arbetar på Enklare Vardag, har arbetat där eller har annan insyn i företaget. Det är såväl personer som haft arbetstillstånd och asyl-

vara Vardag. De kommer alla från Iran och flera av dem har kommit till Sverige med hjälp av arbetstillstånd knutna till företaget. De berättar hur de arbetar betydligt mer än vad lagen tillåter och för mycket låga löner. En person med insyn i företagets administration ger exempel på en anställd som arbetade 250 timmar en månad men bara fick betalt för 160 timmar.  
- Jag jobbar sju dagar i veckan, min familj säger att jag aldrig är hemma. Jag jobbar varje dag till sent, berättar en av de anställda.  
**UTNYTTJAR PERSONALEN**  
**Enklare Vardag är ett stort företag.** I Stockholms stad har de sjunde störst omsättning bland hemtjänstföretagen, bakom jättar som Attendo. De har avtal med sju kommuner i Stockholmsområdet och hade i december förra året totalt 202 kunder.  
Vi har pratat med nio personer som arbetar på Enklare Vardag, har arbetat där eller har annan insyn i företaget. Det är såväl personer som haft arbetstillstånd och asyl-

**"Jag jobbade från klockan sju på morgonen till elva på kvällen och min lön var bara 11 000 kronor."**  
sökande som "vanliga" anställda. De har erfarenheter från företaget i nästan alla kommuner där det är verksam. De ger alla samma bild: Enklare Vardag agerar sig ut en omfattande och systematiskt utnyttjande av sin personal.  
**Enklare Vardag har kollektivavtal** och på pappret är lönerna tillräckligt höga. Men flera källor berättar att företaget vid kräver att vissa av dem som arbetar på arbetstillstånd ska jobba en viss antal timmar i månaden – ofta runt 200 timmar. Jobbar de mindre måste de betala tillbaka delar av den redan låga lönen.  
- Om jag jobbar 200 timmar behö-

ver jag inte betala tillbaka. Men om jag jobbar 165 eller 170 timmar måste jag lämna tillbaka 4 000 eller 5 000 varje månad, berättar en anställd. Arbetstiden omfattar dock bara registrerad tid hos kunderna – inte restiden mellan kunder. Det betyder att de 200 timmarna i själva verket är ännu fler.  
- För att få ihop en timme måste du i verkligheten jobba mycket mer, säger en källa.  
Arbetet och Kommunalarbetaren har också pratat med en person som sett hur personal strax efter löning tagit ut kontanter och lämnat över dem till en mellanhand direkt vid bankomaten. En annan berättar att han tvingats betala pengar ut egen ficka till kunder för att de inte ska byta hemtjänstföretag.  
**ARBETAR UNDER HOT**  
**Personalen vi träffar** är några av de 53 personer som beviljats arbetstillstånd för att jobba på Enklare Vardag sedan 2009. Enklare Vardag ligger trea på listan över de hemtjänstföretag i Sverige med flest ansökningar om arbetstillstånd de

senaste fem åren. De två som har fler är betydligt större företag.  
En övervägande majoritet av de som beviljats arbetstillstånd för jobb på Enklare Vardag, 37 stycken, är iranska medborgare. Ytterligare 10 är svenska medborgare, men vilket medborgarskap de hade när de kom till Sverige är okänt, enligt Migrationsverket.  
Flera berättar om hot om att tvingas lämna tillbaka till Iran om arbetsvillkoren inte passar. Det tar fyra år innan någon med arbetstillstånd kan ansöka om ett permanent uppehållstillstånd. Under den tiden biter personalen ihop.  
- Det är jättehårt att arbeta där. De hotar mig, om du inte gör som vi säger kan vi avsluta ditt arbetstillstånd, berättar en anställd.  
Det finns också uppgifter från flera håll om att personal har tvingats skriva på ett uppsägningsskettur utan datum för att få en tillståndsansökan.  
- På så sätt kan företaget när som helst bli av med en genom att skriva ett datum tre månader bak i tiden och så får man sluta på dagen, säger en anställd.

**Jag har ingen kraft kvar.**  
Kvinnan som sitter mitt emot oss i köket i en lägenhet i Stockholmsområdet har mörka ringar under ögonen. Just i dag har hon "bara" jobbat elva timmar i hemtjänsten, men andra dagar kan det bli mer. Hon berättar om månader när hon arbetat 250 timmar, hur hon inte hinner träffa sin familj, inte har några raster och inte hinner gå på toaletten. Men det är inte bara det – trots slitet tjänar hon mindre än en heltidslön.  
- Jag jobbade från klockan sju på morgonen till halv elva på kvällen och min lön var bara 11 000 kronor. Jag har ingen ob, ingen semester, jag jobbade nätter, kvällar, lördagar och söndagar, berättar hon.  
Hon visar upp ett lönebesked där hon tjänat 14 000 kronor föregående – samtidigt som hon arbetat 260 timmar den månaden. Det ger en timlön på knappt 54 kronor, vilket är 51 kronor mindre än lägsta lönen i kollektivavtalet.  
**Hon är inte ensam.** Runt köksbordet sitter flera som arbetar eller har arbetat på hemtjänstföretaget Enklare Vardag. De kommer alla från Iran och flera av dem har kommit till Sverige med hjälp av arbetstillstånd knutna till företaget. De berättar hur de arbetar betydligt mer än vad lagen tillåter och för mycket låga löner. En person med insyn i företagets administration ger exempel på en anställd som arbetade 250 timmar en månad men bara fick betalt för 160 timmar.  
- Jag jobbar sju dagar i veckan, min familj säger att jag aldrig är hemma. Jag jobbar varje dag till sent, berättar en av de anställda.  
**UTNYTTJAR PERSONALEN**  
**Enklare Vardag är ett stort företag.** I Stockholms stad har de sjunde störst omsättning bland hemtjänstföretagen, bakom jättar som Attendo. De har avtal med sju kommuner i Stockholmsområdet och hade i december förra året totalt 202 kunder.  
Vi har pratat med nio personer som arbetar på Enklare Vardag, har arbetat där eller har annan insyn i företaget. Det är såväl personer som haft arbetstillstånd och asyl-

vara Vardag. De kommer alla från Iran och flera av dem har kommit till Sverige med hjälp av arbetstillstånd knutna till företaget. De berättar hur de arbetar betydligt mer än vad lagen tillåter och för mycket låga löner. En person med insyn i företagets administration ger exempel på en anställd som arbetade 250 timmar en månad men bara fick betalt för 160 timmar.  
- Jag jobbar sju dagar i veckan, min familj säger att jag aldrig är hemma. Jag jobbar varje dag till sent, berättar en av de anställda.  
**UTNYTTJAR PERSONALEN**  
**Enklare Vardag är ett stort företag.** I Stockholms stad har de sjunde störst omsättning bland hemtjänstföretagen, bakom jättar som Attendo. De har avtal med sju kommuner i Stockholmsområdet och hade i december förra året totalt 202 kunder.  
Vi har pratat med nio personer som arbetar på Enklare Vardag, har arbetat där eller har annan insyn i företaget. Det är såväl personer som haft arbetstillstånd och asyl-

**"Jag jobbade från klockan sju på morgonen till elva på kvällen och min lön var bara 11 000 kronor."**  
sökande som "vanliga" anställda. De har erfarenheter från företaget i nästan alla kommuner där det är verksam. De ger alla samma bild: Enklare Vardag agerar sig ut en omfattande och systematiskt utnyttjande av sin personal.  
**Enklare Vardag har kollektivavtal** och på pappret är lönerna tillräckligt höga. Men flera källor berättar att företaget vid kräver att vissa av dem som arbetar på arbetstillstånd ska jobba ett visst antal timmar i månaden – ofta runt 200 timmar. Jobbar de mindre måste de betala tillbaka delar av den redan låga lönen.  
- Om jag jobbar 200 timmar behö-

ver jag inte betala tillbaka. Men om jag jobbar 165 eller 170 timmar måste jag lämna tillbaka 4 000 eller 5 000 varje månad, berättar en anställd. Arbetstiden omfattar dock bara registrerad tid hos kunderna – inte restiden mellan kunder. Det betyder att de 200 timmarna i själva verket är ännu fler.  
- För att få ihop en timme måste du i verkligheten jobba mycket mer, säger en källa.  
Arbetet och Kommunalarbetaren har också pratat med en person som sett hur personal strax efter löning tagit ut kontanter och lämnat över dem till en mellanhand direkt vid bankomaten. En annan berättar att han tvingats betala pengar ut egen ficka till kunder för att de inte ska byta hemtjänstföretag.  
**ARBETAR UNDER HOT**  
**Personalen vi träffar** är några av de 53 personer som beviljats arbetstillstånd för att jobba på Enklare Vardag sedan 2009. Enklare Vardag ligger trea på listan över de hemtjänstföretag i Sverige med flest ansökningar om arbetstillstånd de

senaste fem åren. De två som har fler är betydligt större företag.  
En övervägande majoritet av de som beviljats arbetstillstånd för jobb på Enklare Vardag, 37 stycken, är iranska medborgare. Ytterligare 10 är svenska medborgare, men vilket medborgarskap de hade när de kom till Sverige är okänt, enligt Migrationsverket.  
Flera berättar om hot om att tvingas lämna tillbaka till Iran om arbetsvillkoren inte passar. Det tar fyra år innan någon med arbetstillstånd kan ansöka om ett permanent uppehållstillstånd. Under den tiden biter personalen ihop.  
- Det är jättehårt att arbeta där. De hotar mig, om du inte gör som vi säger kan vi avsluta ditt arbetstillstånd, berättar en anställd.  
Det finns också uppgifter från flera håll om att personal har tvingats skriva på ett uppsägningsskettur utan datum för att få en tillståndsansökan.  
- På så sätt kan företaget när som helst bli av med en genom att skriva ett datum tre månader bak i tiden och så får man sluta på dagen, säger en anställd.

Figure 1: Article. Arbetet journal. No. 8, 7-8 March, 2019

## 4.1 TEXTUAL ANALYSIS

### Headline

This paper deals with a written journalistic text throughout its inverted pyramid structure. The text story can be divided based on journalistic conventions: headline, ingress, body text, fact boxes, where subheads can subdivide the body text. The analysis follows throughout the structure of the article and deals with the textual dimension first. While discourse and social hypothesis come simultaneously with missing gaps in textual analysis. The interpretation and explanation follow each transitivity analysis.

The headline of the article: “”Hon har den här pyramiden där vi är slavar och hon är härskare” describes a material process shown by the female actor in third person *hon* that had an impact to the goal which is the *pyramid* where beneficiaries *we* are relatively affected, creating circumstances of the *hon or she is being* an *impress* and beneficiaries *slaves*. Here used metaphors such as *pyramid*, *slaves* and *impress*. The headline is in the whole a verbal process of the unmentioned *sayers*. We can easily see that the *sayers* are identified as *we* in the meaning. Moreover, the relationship between *her and us* is a dictatorship alike and unfair one. Who are *us* that is narrating the headline?

*Hon har den här pyramiden där vi är slavar och hon är härskare*

*She has this pyramid, where we are slaves and she is an impress.*

ARBETET NR8. March 7-8 2019

### Transitivity

She	Has	This pyramid	Where we are slaves	Also, she is an impress
Actor (female)	Relational process	goal	circumstance	circumstance

For the readers who are familiar with the *Arbetet* newspaper's concept, or any other newspaper headlines, it is clear that the disadvantaged employer's voice is being put as *we* in the title of this article. Voices of *we* are taken a mental, verbal, behavioral, and relational process, while *she* is taken only relational process. Which implies that the *female actor's* actions have been having a significant impact on the individuals' situation who have rights to speak, think, and relate. The writer speaks as if he or

she is the voice of the impacted sides. There is a unity between the identities of journalist and the sayer. Even though it is not yet clear what field of labor we are talking about here.

The headline here appears as the reported speech. The black background can be understood as the article is negative in meaning. Those who narrate this article as *we* are not satisfied with their position as *slaves*. Someone is identified here as a *härskare/impress* of the metaphorical pyramid. Fairclough pays a close look at the construction of identities and the construction of relations. (Fairclough 1995:126). In his analysis on identity and social relations in media Fairclough emphasizes diversity, multiplicity, and variability of identities in media. It appears that journalists' identity here is reporters of the speech, where the voice of the *enslaved* part is freely expressed, and there is a *she* whose identity seems directly villainous.

Swedish society is familiar with the discourse of *the labor rights movement, right for voice and equality* discourse. Such an assumption would account for the worker's dissatisfaction over the management of the unit where they work. In Swedish society, the collective agreement is known to be required for all state municipal works. From here, the assumption is that *she*, that the headline is talking about can be a private company owner or a manager.

It has to be included that *Arbetet* newspaper updated the article and changed its headline into *Välfärdbranschens skuggsida - Avslöjande: Slavliknande villkor på short hemtjänstföretag*, later this year. This headline text is constructed with *Arbetet* and *Kommunalarbetaren* (unmentioned *actors*)'s material process, which is *avslöja/reveal*. The verb is formulated in a passive form, and the receiver of this material process appears to be the home service company. In this headline, the newspaper holds power over the big home service company in a way which it inflicts material process onto it.

Ingress

The ingress of the story provides clarification to missing parts:

*Anställda måste lämna tillbaka delar av sin lön – annars riskerar de att tvingas lämna Sverige. Arbetet och Kommunalarbetaren kan avslöja slavliknande arbetsvillkor och omfattande fusk i hemtjänstföretaget Enklare Vardag. Samtidigt har vd:n tjänat över 20 miljoner de senaste åtta åren.*

*Employees must/have to give back some of their salaries – otherwise, they risk to be forced to leave Sweden. Arbetet and Kommunalarbetaren can reveal slavish employment conditions and extensive cheating at home service company Enklare Vardag. At the same time, the CEO of the company earned over 20 million in the last eight years.*

*ARBETET NR8. March 7-8 2019*

Even though in the first two sentences, there are many passive verbs, they are all transitive, in a way which they have objects to affect. The following table provides transitivity according to three participants of depicted in the ingress of the story.

Participants	Activity	process		
employers	must/have to give back  risks to be forced to leave	Material  material		
Arbetet and Kommunalarbetaren	Can reveal	material		
Company Enklare Vardag	(creating) slavish employment conditions  extensive cheating	Material  behavioral		
CEO of the company	earned	material		

In the first sentence, there is an unmentioned actor who affects employee's action in a high degree. There is modality in here, and this sentence means that the recipients – employees give back the part of their salary in order not to risk leaving Sweden. It is clear so far that there is someone with enormous power is making *a material process* that affects *employees'* action. In this scenario, employees have the only process which does not include any mental, behavioral, verbal processes. This circumstance is directly related to the material process of the powerful one.

Who is the one who forces employees to give back a certain amount of their salary? Who is the one who forces them to leave Sweden otherwise? Is that the same actor or the different actors? In the discourse of immigration, the right to stay in Sweden depends on Swedish Immigration Agency. Swedish society is familiar with the fact that to earn a right to stay in Sweden, and a foreign citizen must have a work permit, which is earned through four years of employment. However, other factors legitimize Swedish residence, (Migrationsverket.se. (2018). *Olika skäl för uppehållstillstånd.*), most relevant one here seems to be the work permit. In retrospect, the affected employees' identity can be put by far as foreign citizens, who are trying to get Swedish residence through a work permit. Stay or leave Sweden is decided the Immigration Agency. So, is the Immigration agency that is making them pay back some of their loans and forcing them to leave Sweden? However, here, the immigration agency is not mentioned at all. Moreover, it implies as if the CEO of the company decides foreign employees' immigration status.

Following two meanings depict the material process of the *Arbetet and Kommunalarbetaren* with permission modality 'can.' They can if they want to reveal Enklare Vardag company's cheating and slavish employment conditions. The ingress of the story further extracts, sharing the material process of the CEO of the company. Who has earned twenty million in the last eight years?

The thematic structure of the article is seen in the gist of the story so far. The hybridity of discourse on employment rights, power relations between employer and employees, immigration discourse, is to be discussed in the article. Power relation between the participants seen as employees are seen to be less powerful, while the CEO of the company holds power over their economic, work, and residence circumstances. If one could use the pyramid metaphor that is employed by the journalists, on the top of this article's pyramid sits journalists themselves in a way which they hold power over the CEO of the company. With the reader, the journalists hold power as being identified as the informer, exposé.

As Lundström's study indicates that in benefit fraud articles, there is a clear symbolic distinction between one specific group of citizens, articulated as illegitimate and undeserving, i.e., immigrants, and other citizens. (Lundström 2013:642). Here, in this ingress' transitivity analysis shows that there are two groups of citizens in the benefit fraud discourse. Differently as depicted in most benefit cheat media representations, in this article, there is a head of the company who is being identified as a cheater and minority group, and immigrants voice is being heard. Study shows that in UK and Swedish newspaper and blog discourse that constructs the undeserving group of benefit recipients, including disability, unemployment, and immigrants, blaming the welfare system that 'enables' those "groups" to "thrive" (Lundström 2013). This paper would argue that in this article, the same pattern of constructing the undeserving individual of benefit recipient is repeated. Just the "thrivers" is represented as the CEO of

the company, who are taking advantage of immigrant's vulnerable position. It seems to suggest that the welfare state should enforce its monitors and control, evolve towards the "hygienic government" (Hughes 2015:4). Why and how immigrants get put in this vulnerable position is not discussed, where the same type of ableist ideology construction plays a role in making "those" people more vulnerable.

## Body text

It is easier to divide the body text into three main sections: the first part, second part: takes advantage of the staff, third part: works under threat. The body texts in general consists of the verbal process of the employees of the company and journalists' additional facts. While there is generally reflected the employees' stories about how company threatens them, there is a thematic difference between part. The first part generally deals with work conditions of the employers of *Enklare Vardag*. The second part goes in more details into the company's background information. The third part depicts citizenship and immigration issues.

## First part

*"I have no power left."*

*Says a woman who is sitting in front of us, in the kitchen of the Stockholm area flat. She has dark rings under her eyes.*

*Just today she has worked "only eleven hours at the home service, which can be more in some other days. She talks about months where she worked 250 hours, how she does not have time to meet their family, that she has no breaks or time to visit a bathroom. That is not all – despite being worn out, she earns less than a whole - time loan.*

*I worked from six o'clock in the morning until ten and thirty in the evening and my loan was only 11 000 SEK. I have any inconvenient working hours allowance, any holidays, I worked nights, Saturdays and Sundays, she says.*

*She shows a loan clearance there she earned 14 000 SEK before tax – at the same time that she worked 260 hours that month. That gives an hourly wage of only under 54 SEK, which is 51 SEK lower than the lowest wage in the collective agreement.*

*She is not alone. Around the kitchen, the board sits several workers at the home service company Enklare Vardag. They are all from Iran, and some of them came to Sweden with the help of work permit, linked to the company. They tell us how they work much more than the law allows for how much low wages. A person who has insight into the company's administration gives an example of an employee who worked for 250 hours in a month and got paid for 160 hours.*

*– I work for seven days a week, and my family says that I am never home. I work daily until late, tells one of the employees.*

ARBETET NR8. March 7-8 2019

## Transitivity analysis

Actor

Activity

Process

Employees	says	verbal
	sitting	Material
	has	Relational
	Worked	Material
	Does not have	Relational
	Meet	Material
	Being worn out	Behavioral
	Earns	Material
	Come	Material
	give	Material
	shows	Material

In the first part of the text, employees are constructed with predominantly material, verbal, relational processes. There is any process connected with *Enklare Vardag* company itself, while a negative picture of the company quickly paints in the reader's mind when one reads the employee's actions. Identity of the interviewee shifts from the direct narrator and reported speech by journalists which indicates the journalists' role as a supporter of the cause and explainer. Here the reader is put in a position where they are being informed. The collective agreement is mentioned in this section. The collective agreement in Sweden is defined as:

*A collective agreement is a voluntary agreement between employers and employees on employees' rights at the workplace. The collective agreement regulates pay increases every year, overtime pay, supplementary insurance schemes, the right to exert influence, and more. If one is employed at a workplace with a collective agreement, then one can be safe in the knowledge that there is a good agreement for the employee that covers the pay, form of employment, working hours, holidays, the period of notice and much more.*

(*Unionen*, 2019)

It is believed socially that: through its laws and regulations, Sweden strives to ensure that no one is disadvantaged because they belong to a minority. (sweden.se, 2019). This ideology is revealed in transitivity analysis of this first section. The article wants to support this discourse.

The *Enklare Vardag* says and does nothing in this part of the text. Transitivity analysis in this part of the text reveals the trade unions newspaper's openness to employee's voices.

Swedish ideology likes to entertain the discourse of the open and transparent country. The media discourse on Sweden mostly suggests that openness and transparency are vital parts of Swedish democracy. It is said that four fundamental laws protect the democratic society: the [Instrument of Government](#), the [Freedom of the Press Act](#), the [Fundamental Law on Freedom of Expression](#), and the [Act of Succession](#). (sweden.se, 2019). Research shows that both in international social policy discourse and among welfare researchers, Sweden has-along with the other Nordic countries traditionally been viewed as something close to the ideal of the institutionally redistributive welfare state. (Lundström 1996) There is a right for the association, which implies that Sweden gives freedom to employees to join a trade union. Trade unions establish a safe ground for collective agreement in the Swedish labor market.

The article mentions the collective agreement. Nothing is informed whether the employer forbade employees to contact the associations or threatened them not to. The argument is that when a person immigrates to a new country, it is practically almost impossible to have enough information about joining a trade union or knowing their rights. Swedish Immigration agency does not contact trade unions when they help asylum seekers to find a job. That is the challenge for trade unions, which they want to change. (Klint et al., 2019). There is an ideology of equality in the article, which acts as asylum seekers right demand. It could be argued that asylum seekers and immigrant workers cannot know or demand right for the association and collective agreement on the first place. Because *right for union* appears to be usually an individual's choice and nobody, neither the Immigration Agency nor the employer informs this to the asylum seekers. (Klind et al., 2019)

Additionally, this paper might suggest that Sarah Ahmed's idea of loving a nation means that protecting it from "others," who are taking which is "ours". In this article's case, it is reflected as protecting Swedish ideology of equality from heads of the company like *Enklare Vardag* who takes advantage of asylum seekers. Transitivity analysis exposes ideology that asylum seekers supposed to be treated *equally*. The *othering tendency* of benefit cheat discourse still exists. It is aimed in this case towards the CEO

of the Enklare Vardag. However, in reality, asylum seeker's vulnerability and exposure to adverse working conditions depend on many other factors as well, for instance, the Immigration Agency's cooperation with Trade Union, lack of sufficient information. Asylum seems to have used as "poster children" (Longmore, P., 2013. 'Heaven's Special Child') in this article. In purpose to delegitimizing and frame entrepreneurs, especially welfare CEOs such as *Enklare Vardag corp.* Besides, it is known that *Enklare Vardag's* CEO coincidentally happens to be a foreign citizen – Fariba Bameti. Grounded on this analysis, one would argue that emotions of blame, resentment (Hughes 2015; Lundström 2013) in benefit fraud discourse, ableism in a way which othering of the minority group (which is CEO of the welfare company), parentalism of the asylum seekers still play a role in Swedish society. The vulnerability of asylum seekers to be taken advantage by fraudulent employers is highly dependent on the system. However, it seems like that the taken for granted Swedish ideology of equality and human rights is not willing to bring into light the real shadow of its international image, choosing instead to project it on entrepreneurs.

## Body text - the second part

### *Takes advantage of the employees*

*Enklare Vardag is a big company. In Stockholm city, they are the seventh most significant revenue among the home service companies, behind the giants such as Attendo. They have agreements with seven municipalities in Stockholm's area and in December of the last year, they had 202 customers.*

*We spoke with nine people who work at the Enklare Vardag, have worked, or have another link to the company. Those are both people who had a work permit and asylum seekers like "normal" employees. They have experiences from the company in almost all the municipalities where the company is active. They all give the same picture: Enklare Vardag dedicates to the extensive and systematic exploitation of their employees.*

*Enklare Vardag has a collective agreement – and wage amounts are high enough on the papers. However, several sources have told us that the CEO requires those with a work permit to work for a certain amount of times in a month – often around 200 hours. If they work less than that, they must pay back parts of their already low wages back.*

*– If I work for 200 hours, I do not need to pay back. However, if I work for 165 or 170 hours, I must give back 4000 or 5000 SEK every month, tells one employee.*

*Working hours include only registered hours at customers – not the journey time between customers. That means that those 200 hours are more than that.*

*– To get together an hour, you have to work much more. That is not that if you work eight hours, you get paid for eight hours, says one source.*

*Arbetaren and Kommunalarbetaren have also talked to a person who with own eyes saw how a worker soon after waging, takes out cash and gives it back to the intermediary who met him/her directly at the cash machine. Another one tells about how he was forced to pay from his pocket to customers so that they will not change the home service company.*

ARBETET NR8. March 7-8 2019

Actor	Activity	Process
Enklare Vardag company/ intermediary	Takes advantage Is/are Have/ had Dedicates Exploits Requires met	Material relational relational behavioural material verbal material
We/journalists/Arbetaren and KA	Spoke/talked	verbal
People/employees	Work Have Give Told/said Must payback Do not need Seen Takes out Gives back Forced to pay	material relational material verbal material material (modality) mental material material material (modality)

customers

Will not change

material

In this part of the text, transitivity analysis shows that employees are regarded with mostly material, verbal processes as well. The company is depicted with more processes in this section, where they are mostly relational. However, verbal and material processes are also constructed with the company's actions. Journalists named their verbal action. Another actor is added in this section, which is customers. However, customers action depicted only once about the company and its employees. The most important part of the home service company and employment is true, customers. However, employees are depicted mostly with material actions, and the company's requirements mostly passivize those. This suggests that employers are acting against their will, under the company's discipline.

This analysis shows that the article mostly deals with the employment right violation, and benefit cheating discourse, power relation, and immigration discourse. The article discounts a significant part in this field, who are disabled people or people in need of assistance. Trade union movement stands for workers' right. Immigrants are also employers. They should not be disregarded, means the article. However, it is not mentioned, the another affected part is and should be the caretakers.

In the sentence: "*To get together an hour, you have to work much more.*" It is used Swedish *du* which is more personal you, than collective English you. In that way, the identity of the reader in this section assumed to be a trade union member or an employee in the welfare sector. The addressee is individuals who are familiar to Swedish work market and part-time jobs. This way, it states that the article is meant for employers, not their customers. It is asking the reader to put themselves in the employees' shoes.

Common sense assumption here is that "you gotta get paid for the times that you worked." The Swedish job market is as mentioned before, known with its "Swedish way," collective agreement, right for the association. It shows that in Swedish society, those requirements are met on a large scale and expected to be met whether you are an asylum seeker or a Swedish citizen.

## Body text – the third part

### *Works under threat*

*The staff we met are some of the 53 people who have been issued a work permit to work at Enklare Vardag, since 2009. Enklare Vardag is third in the list of home service companies in Sweden with most applications about work permit for the past five years. The two that have more are significantly more substantial companies.*

*A considerable majority of those who have been granted work permits for jobs on Enklare Vardag, 37, are Iranian citizens. Another ten are Swedish citizens, but what citizenship they had when they came to Sweden is unknown, according to the Swedish Immigration Agency.*

*Some of them tell about the threats to be forced to return to Iran if the working conditions do not meet. During that time, employees bite the bullet.*

*– It is tough to work there. She threatens me, if you do not do as we say, we can end your work permit, tells an employee.*

*There is as well information from different sides about a staff member who has been forced to sign on a termination paper without a date to get an indeterminate length contract.*

*– This way, the company can get rid of one at any time by writing a date three months back in time and then one can end the day, says one employee.*

ARBETET NR8. March 7-8 2019

## Transitivity

<b>Actor</b>	<b>Activity</b>	<b>Process</b>
<b>Employes/staff</b>	Works	Material
	Is	Relational
	tells	Verbal
	bites the bullet	Behavioural
	tells	tells
	forced to sign	material
	don't do	material

	get	material
<b>Iranian citizens</b>	Are	relational
	Forced to return	material
	Are	relational
	meet	material
<b>Swedish citizens</b>	had	relational
<b>We/journalists/the newspaper</b>	met	Material
<b>Enklare Vardag/CEO</b>	issued	Material
	is	Relational
	granted	Material
	are	relational
	are	relational
	threatens	material
	say	verbal
	can end	material
	get rid of	material

writing

material

accords

verbal

### **Swedish immigration Agency**

There are six main actors in this final part of the text. Employees and company are constructed with most and relatively equal amounts of material, verbal, relational, and behavioral processes. It implies that the text illustrates the power relationship between workers and the company. Modalities in some processes show that the company has the upper hand in the activities of the workers. It is described that most of the employers are foreign workers, uniquely Iranian, who are majoring work permit to stay in Sweden. In here, the Immigration agency which regulates immigration politics depicted with only informing activity. This analysis brings into light the vulnerability of the immigrants in Sweden. It shows that human and labor right violation is easily possible in contemporary Sweden with highly vulnerable asylum seekers. However, what makes them so vulnerable to being taken advantage is not mentioned. Immigration Agency and government activities around immigrant's rights are not depicted. The main - focus is on the benefit cheater. This might be assumed that the ableism of right-wing media depiction of benefit cheat discourse is still in work in this trade union newspaper article. In benefit fraud articles, there is a clear symbolic distinction between one specific group of citizens, articulated as illegitimate and undeserving. (Lundström 2013:642). Those types of texts do not attempt to beat fraud, but attack welfare state and recipients of liberal welfare to delegitimize the more general aim and purpose of the welfare state. (Ibid).

Earlier studies suggest that benefit fraud discourse is increasingly depicted in contemporary western world's right-wing mass media. For instance, in the UK: "The Welfare Reform Act (2012) brought about changes to benefit entitlement and assessment for disabled people, with measures to reduce the budget in this area justified within parts of the Conservative party and right-wing media through the use of narratives of deserving and undeserving citizens." (McEnhill, Byrne. 2014). Sweden, with the other Nordic countries traditionally been viewed as something close to the ideal of the institutionally redistributive welfare state. (Lundström, 1996). However, Swedish media discourse has been against the fact that refugees immigrate to Sweden as personal care assistants especially from Irak, Syria, and Iran, calling it as "their way to immigrate to Sweden" (Expressen.se, 2017). In early 2018 there has

been a scandal in Sweden where social insurance office's general director Ann-Marie Begler gets prematurely fired from her job after strict investigation and activities that caused many people to lose their care assistance and seek leave compensation payments. It is believed as well that the Social Insurance Office had to act that way because of the press from the government. (SvD.se, 2019). Those discourses indicate that identification of deserving and undeserving citizens was and is going on in Sweden as well.

This analysis shows that the article of trade union newspaper speaks more and mostly on refugees side and express their voice. However, the paper argues that the pattern of blaming, othering, shaping the undeserving citizen is repeated here as well. The scapegoat is here the CEO of the company, while refugees are used as mentioned before as "poster children," in a parentalism discourse to lift Swedish false ideology of equality. The transitivity analysis shows that, in reality, the CEO of the companies who hire refugees and take advantage of them is just a small symptom of significant disease. That said, the desire to remain morally superior, most democratic country while protecting itself from *those*, who want to take this image away dominates in contemporary Sweden. To protect means to fight, to fight means to be divided into them and us. There is no democracy in the separation of them and us.

## 4.2 VIEW OF WARD WORKERS

This chapter deals with ward workers' view, reflected in the interview. This part of the thesis focuses on how audience members who work in warship sector interpret the article. As signified before discourse analysis thinks of the discursive practices as a community – in terms of a network. This paper went through the identification of such sets and their interrelationship in terms of their hegemonic structure by analyzing three main categories of function *ideational*, *interpersonal*, and *textual*. On the other side, the project primarily invests in understanding how the audience reflects on these kinds of texts and how that understanding supports or establishes common-sense assumption on given sets of social discourses. Opinions of wardship workers from different backgrounds draw interest. Audience interpretation of the article might enrich the social explanation of the media language.

Each participant received a copy of the article and additional paper with an open question.

Questions:

Vad handlar artikeln om? (Svara gärna så långt som ni kan). Handlar det mest om välfärds fusk, eller arbetsmarknad eller invandrings problem, eller svensk systemet av arbetsmarknad?

Är det någon som utsatt i orättvisa? I så fall vem? (exempelvis: invandrarna eller egen företagare, eller skattebetalarna)

Vilka tankar om samhället och arbetsmarknaden väcks när ni läser artikeln.

Vem är offer och vem är skurken i bredare syn? Exempelvis: asylsökande, VD av företagen, orättvis samhällssystem, eller något annat?<sup>1</sup>

Answer analysis

*Next table is direct written views/answers of the natively born and raised local Swedish wardship workers analyzed in this section.*

	<b>First native Swedish wardship worker</b>	<b>Second native Swedish wardship worker</b>	<b>Third native Swedish wardship worker</b>
<b>Vad handlar artikeln om? (Svara gärna så långt som ni kan). Handlar det mest om välfärds fusk, eller arbetsmarknad eller invandrings problem, eller svensk systemet av arbetsmarknad?</b>	Det handlar om hur arbetsgivaren utnyttjar personalen som är i beroendeställning. Privata företag har lätt att fuska med anställningar.	Det handlar om människor i en utsatt situation som blir utnyttjade av företag som systematiskt låter människor slavat utan varken skälig lön eller trygghet. Företaget vet att invandrare i deras situation inte kan protestera, anmäla eller komma med krav av rädsla att bli utan pengar eller tvingas lämna landet.	Den handlar om välfärdsfusk där högt uppsatta chefer utnyttjar arbetskraften.

---

<sup>1</sup> What is this article about? Is this more about benefit cheat, or immigration issues, or swedish employment system?

Is there someone who is unfairly treated? If so, who? (e.g., refugees, entrepreneurs, taxpayers?)

When you read this article, what thoughts arise in you about society and the labor market?

On a broader perspective, who is the victim and who is the villain? (e.g., refugees, CEO of the company, unfair social system, or something else.)

<p>Är det någon som utsatt i orättvisa? I så fall vem? (exempelvis: invandrarna eller egen företagare, eller skattebetalarna)</p>	<p>Det är i hör grad invandrare som är utsatt i orättvisa.</p>	<p>Till största delen invandrarna som inte har samma väl möjligheter som svenskar att få jobb. Och därför tvingas ta skitjobb. Eftersom inga andra alternativ finns.</p>	<p>Främst är det de som arbetar som är utsatt för orättvisa, vilket i detta fall är de som invandrat till Sverige och arbetar för företag.</p>
<p>Vilka tankar om samhället och arbetsmarknaden väcks när ni läser artikeln.</p>	<p>Jag är oroad över att sådant här förekommer.</p>	<p>Det måste vara bättre koll på företagen, vilka lönen dom betalar ut. Att avtal följs så att alla har samma rätt till jobb. Semester osv. Måste bli bättre uppföljning av företagen att lagarna följs.</p>	<p>Det känns fruktansvärt! Det ska inte få till så här.</p>
<p>Vem är offer och vem är skurken i bredare syn? Exempelvis: asylsökande, VD av företagen, orättvis samhällssystem, eller något annat?</p>	<p>Asylsökande är offer. VD av företagaren är skurken. Vårdtagarna är också offer, när det ska få omvårdnad av trötta arbetare.<sup>2</sup></p>	<p>Som invandrare/asylsökande får man fel bild av samhället man är på väg in i om landet tillåter att människor blir utnyttjade och hotade utan att någon ingriper. Man vet inte rättigheter. Börja man</p>	<p>Skurken tycker jag är VD:n av företaget men det måste också finnas något fel I samhällssystemet när ingen sätter stopp för detta. Offer tycker jag är de asylsökande<sup>4</sup></p>

<sup>2</sup> It is about how the employer takes advantage of the dependent employees. It is easy for private companies to cheat with employment. It is immigrants, to a large extent, are exposed to injustice. I am worried that this is the case. Refugees are victims. CEO of the company is the villain. Care recipients are also victims when they get ward from tired employees.

<sup>4</sup> This is about benefit cheat, their top executives take advantage of the workforce. Foremost, those who are employed are affected by injustice, who are in this case those who immigrated to Sweden and work for the company. It feels terrible! It shouldn't be like that. The villain is the CEO of the company, I think. However, there

protestera, så man riskerar  
mycket.<sup>3</sup>

## Analysis

In the first native Swedish worker's answer, the main actors are the company/CEO and immigrants. The company/CEO is given mostly material process, while immigrants are given a relational process. Which shows that the reader's translation of the text focuses on the power relation of the wardship entrepreneur and refugee employees. This reader assumes that such activities are the reality. This is a reflection of an individual wardship worker's view on taken for the granted social situation on contemporary society, in which refugees get treated that way. This answer implies that in today's Sweden, it is not uncommon for entrepreneurs to take advantage of the refugees. Concerning this kind of activities, the caretakers, who are in need suffer most.

---

should be something wrong in the social system when nobody says *stop* to this. I think that the refugees are the victims here.

<sup>3</sup> It is about people who are in a vulnerable position, where they get taken advantage of the business owners which systematically lets people enslaved nor without reasonable salary neither security. Mostly immigrants are affected, who have not the same good opportunities as swedes to get a job. Therefore they are forced to get crappy jobs. Because there are no other alternatives, there should be better control over business owners, who much salary they are paying. That job contracts are being followed, that all are having the same right to employment. There should be better monitoring over businesses that the laws are being followed as immigrant/refugee one gets a false picture about a society that there are going into if the state allows people to get utilized and threatened without anyone's engagement. One does not know the rights. One has many things at stake if one starts protesting.

The second Swedish native worker answers refer to employees as *people* and connect the number of material, mental (*afraid*) and mostly relational processes with modalities. Modality *cannot* is attached to possible material action of an ill-treated employee would do in similar situations. That would be *a protest, to require*. While modality *forced to* is used with verbs: *enslaved, stay without money*. On the other hand, the company is given material, mental (*knows*) process activities. That implies the power relationship between the employer and employee is as well highly reflected by this participant. Not alike with the first participant, she/he includes more modality and mental activities. Which makes possible a translation that as a representation of native Swedish wardship worker, she/he sees the employees as equal human beings. But in her/his mind, immigrants are inarguably dependent upon actions of others, especially country, and the employers. Refugees have not the same privilege in standing up for themselves in a seemingly equal society.

This interviewee reflects an unconsciously constructed common sense that immigrants are not equal. The idea was that the immigrants are not equally treated at the job market. It somehow asserts Lundström's idea about in benefit cheat discourse, drawing a symbolic distinction between deserving and undeserving citizens. (Lundström 2013:642). That is not to say that the interviewee meant that way. Fairclough's CDA says that a social situation can be found in the text, and there is a hidden common sense which is alive and inaction in society, that immigrants are not equal.

This interviewee refers to an unmentioned actor with the sensual, material process to make changes. A guess is that it is the government that she/he meant. So it is assumed that *something* gives an idea about Sweden to the world, as a "rainbow and sunshine land". Therefore, people come to Sweden. This interview analysis shows that the government and media concentrate on Swedish image as a highly developed, democratic country while the reality is very different. In a way which it discriminates foreigners systematically. As in the analysis, material, sensual, mental processes are mostly related to Swedish citizens, employer, Swedish government, and media, while refugee workers are used with the mostly relational process with modality. The nature of the article plays a role in this construction of clauses by the interviewee. Still, this paper wants to argue that parentalism and orientalism are still at work.

The third native employee participants answer includes three main actors: CEOs, employers-immigrants, fault. CEOs shows one material (*takes advantage*) and one relational process (*is*), while immigrant employees show two relational (*are*) and two material processes (*immigrated, work*). Fault shows one relational process (*must have*) with modality concerning the social system. This indicates that the interviewee might have translated the text as a power relation between employer and employee, where actors are valued equally. There is a proposal not to rush to build a "scapegoat" out of the CEOs

and entrepreneurs who cheat the welfare state. Because there is a fundamental fault in the system, that must be fixed.

Next table is direct written views/answers of the natively born and raised local Swedish wardship workers analyzed in this section.

	First immigrated wardship worker	Second immigrated wardship worker	Third immigrated wardship worker
Vad handlar artikeln om? (Svara gärna så långt som ni kan). Handlar det mest om välfärds fusk, eller arbetsmarknad eller invandrings problem, eller svensk systemet av arbetsmarknad?	Det handlar om orättvisshet mellan invandrare - individer som kommer till Sverige. Problemet är arbetsgivaren och systemet. Det finns ingen kontroll i systemet.	Artikeln handlar om ett företag som driver oärligt verksamhet. Detta är arbetsgivarens fel.	Det handlar om fusk. Företagens fel.
Är det någon som utsatt i orättvisa? I så fall vem? (exempelvis: invandrarna eller egen företagare, eller skattebetalarna)	Alltid som invandrare som blir drabbas med orättvisshet. Därför att du har inget språk, blir du utnyttjade. Man kan inte stå upp mot.	Det är invandrarna som är utsatta. De som driver företaget bör straffas och utvisas om det går.	Invandrarna och skattebetalarna som är utsatta för orättvisa.
Vilka tankar om samhället och arbetsmarknaden väcks när ni läser artikeln.	När man kommer till Sverige man måste lära sig språket. För att få bra jobb. Vissa som svårt att få uppehållstillstånd blir	Samhälls systemet, tycker jag borde bli strängare. Kommunal och fackföreningar borde bli bättre på att upptäcka liknande situationer.	Man måste börja tänka på förebyggande åtgärder från och med nu.

	drabbad, blir utnyttjad om.		
Vem är offer och vem är skurken i bredare syn? Exempelvis: asylsökande, VD av företagen, orättvis samhällssystem, eller något annat?	Jag tycker att det är på systemets fel. Varken på invandrare eller på VD av företaget har fel. <sup>5</sup>	Offren är såklart de som blir tvungna att jobba så mycket. Plus skattebetalarna. Skurken är de svin som driver denna typ av brott med flit. <sup>6</sup>	Offren är de stakars som måste jobba över 200 timmar för att få betalt för så lite pengar. Skurken i det här fallet är de som styr denna typ av verksamhet. <sup>7</sup>

## Analysis

---

<sup>5</sup> This article is about injustice between immigrants - individuals who come to Sweden. The problem is the employer and the system. There is no control over those in the system. It is always, immigrants who suffer from injustice. You (intimate form) get taken advantage of, because of you (intimate form) have not the language. One cannot stand up for oneself, then. When one comes to Sweden, one must learn Swedish to get a good job. Some, who are having a hard time to get a permit to stay gets affected, get taken advantage of. I think that the fault is in the system. Nor immigrants, neither the company is at fault.

<sup>6</sup> The article is about a company which runs fraudulent activities. That is the employer's fault. Immigrants are affected negatively. Those who run the company should get a penalty and even expelled as possible. I think that the social system should get more severe. Municipal and trade unions should become better at discovering similar situations. The victim is, of course, those who are forced to work so much. Plus, taxpayers. The villain is those pigs who run these types of violations with purpose.

<sup>7</sup> That is about a cheat. The company is at fault. Immigrants and taxpayers are those who suffer from injustice. One must start thinking about preventive measures from now on. The victim is those poor things who must work over 200 hours for low wage. The villain, in this case, are those who run the business.

This interviewer's way to construct clauses transitively is different from previous Swedish native counterparts. He/she refers to the immigrants with the mostly material and less relational process.

He/she uses abstract nouns and proverbs as actors such as *this, the problem, the control* while addressing the system, government, and western institutional discrimination in Sweden. It points out the hidden discourse that immigrants feel threatened by something when they have to speak out even if one has lived in the country for several years. Ideology is most potent when it is not seen. Moreover, the racism in Sweden is unconscious, unmentioned, and undiscussed. It is as Sarah Ahmed asserts that love for the nation means that what is ours need to be protected from those. That *something* that makes an immigrated citizen of Sweden afraid to speak out can be the silent but strong ideology of *our Sweden* out in the air.

Immigrants or refugees are regarded with more transitive processes: material, behavioral, and relational, which indicates the participant's identity as an immigrant himself giving more emphasis on them. Usage of intimate *you – du* in Swedish, (which points not on collective *you*, but an individual who is listening or reading) while addressing to immigrants indicates that the participant speaks directly to each immigrant as a close friend, an advisee. On the other hand, the interviewee addresses nor Swedish counterparts, neither employment in Sweden. The fault is assumed to be *system's*, where nor immigrants neither the employer had not much to do. This interviewee's answer matches with the hypothesis and the result of this paper. It suggests that the employers who run similar cheating business are a product of a troubled system. Also, as mentioned in earlier studies that the benefit cheat discourse tends to construct a "scapegoats." This participant's answer analysis shows the most material process and intimate addressing to refugees, which indicates that this is the only answer so far that counted immigrants as human beings who act, speak, think and listen.

Second and third immigrant wardship worker:

This section combined the second and third wardship worker's view. There was a significant similarity in clause construction and message.

The company is shown with the mostly material and relational process with modalities in some parts. Immigrants and taxpayers are shown with mostly relational processes with modalities as well. It suggests that these participants reflect the part of social discourse where blame is put on the entrepreneurs. The focus is mostly on the power relationship between the employer and employee, the cheater, and victims. Immigrants are translated as victims as the article suggests. It is assumed that immigrants' actions are mostly dependent on the employers' action. Participants believe that the municipality coordinators and trade union leaders should enforce the discipline and control on the

cheating business runners, in order to protect employees and taxpayers. The question behind why immigrants are put in this vulnerable position in the first place has not been discussed. It might mean that a specific part of immigrated citizens of Sweden is mostly ignorant of the fundamental institutionalized discrimination that causes many problems for them.

## 5 CONCLUSION

---

The purpose of this research paper was to define the common-sense assumption in Swedish society related to violation of worker's right and benefit cheating.

Transitivity analysis revealed that the given article mostly deals with the power struggle between the CEO of the company and its refugee workers. The article gives a voice and stands on the side of refugee employees by revealing facts about how the company violated Swedish labor rights for the higher income, by taking advantage of immigrants who are in a vulnerable situation. It also triumphs the power of trade union media over business CEOs.

The study builds on contradictory viewpoints, given the fact that *Arbetet* is the trade union media tool and embodies working class; on the other hand, this study partly belongs to *benefit cheat* field. That is to say that on the one hand, this study follows the idea that benefit cheat representations on media usually enforce right-wing politics and criticizes softness of welfare state, demanding to beat the cheat. It is suggested that this kind of media discourse bears the risk of enforcing discrimination and orientalism against considered "undeserving others." Controversially, given paper analyzed benefit cheat discourse on trade union newspaper that stands for *common proletarians*, and empowers equality and human right dignity. The chosen sample choreographs complex intertangle of controversial discourses. Crucial sets of discourses are considered to be labor rights violation, benefits cheat (including orientalism), and dubiously discussions about slavery of asylum seekers. This complexity is attempted to be understood with the tools and theory of Critical Discourse.

This article adds to the construction of common sense on possible deconstruction of the social trust on Swedish image of equality and democracy. On the other hand, benefit cheat discourse pattern is repeated as it constructs undeserving citizen out of the entrepreneurs and protecting Swedish ideology of democracy. The article appears as the voice for the working refugee class while continuing the negative thread of benefit cheat representations that tend to construct undeserving citizen. This article is the mirror reflection of the unspoken Swedish discrimination under covers of its international reputation.

Critical Discourse analysis provides a powerful tool for understanding common sense ground, its role in social construction, identifications, and relationships between different discourses that are dancing in this content, as well as their hegemonical structure. This way this paper attempted to see these different discourse play from observer's perspective to understand the mechanism and the relationship between pieces that actually contradict each other but somehow manage to belong (?) in one context. This paper has been able to partly identify general common sense that is established in this jumble of

discourses, which is broadly a taken for the granted perspective of Swedish justice for employer's behalf, despite their race.

Interview analysis with six wardship workers suggests that this article representation affects to build a discourse against entrepreneurs. There is seen requests to more strict, neoliberal discipline in welfare state and ignorance towards the reason for refugees' vulnerability in democratic Sweden. While there is seen awareness towards refugees' vulnerability cause should be paid attention.

The study has gone some way towards enhancing our understanding of how hidden racism went to the next, paradoxical level along with western development. Undeserving citizen construction of right-wing media is silently crawled into employment right newspaper. Also, continuing to construct new scapegoats, in order to defend what is *ours* from *them*. Ours is, in this case, the ideology of democratic Sweden, which is being destroyed by *those* entrepreneurs. Refugees are used as "poster children" in benefit cheat discourse and racist parentalism, while they still believe in the international image of Sweden. This paper also showed how inhabited immigrants in Sweden feel intimidated to speak out in "democratic society." If racism is, as this paper suggests -- unconscious, hidden as addiction. Acceptance is the first step of healing.

## 6 REFERENCES

---

- Ahmed, S., 2013. *The cultural politics of emotion*. London: Routledge.
- Billig, M., 2003. Critical discourse analysis and the rhetoric of critique. *Critical discourse analysis* (pp. 35-46). London: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Breeze, R., 2011. Critical discourse analysis and its critics. *Pragmatics. Quarterly Publication of the International Pragmatics Association (IPrA)*, 21(4), pp.493-525. Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing Company.
- Brown, B., 2015. *Daring greatly: How the Courage to be vulnerable transforms the way we live, love, parent, and lead*. London: Penguin.
- Brush LD (1997) Worthy widows, welfare cheats: Proper womanhood in expert needs talk about single mothers in the United States, 1900 to 1988. *Gender and Society* 11(6): 720–746.
- Chunn DE and Gavigan SAM (2004) Welfare law, welfare fraud, and the moral regulation of the ‘never deserving’ poor. *Social and Legal Studies* 13(2): 219–243.
- Connor S (2007) We’re onto you: A critical examination of the Department for Work and Pensions’ ‘Targeting Benefit Fraud’ campaign. *Critical Social Policy* 27(2): 231–252.
- Deacon, D., Pickering, M., Golding, P. and Murdock, G., 1999. *Researching communications*. London: Arnold.
- Eagleton, T., 2014. *Ideology*. London and New York: Routledge.
- Fairclough, N., 2001. *Language and power*. Harlow: Pearson Education.
- Fairclough, N., 2013. *Critical discourse analysis: The critical study of language*. London: Routledge.
- Forgacs, D., 1988. *Antonio Gramsci Reader, The*. London: Lawrence & Wishart.
- Fowler, R., 2013. *Language in the News: Discourse and Ideology in the Press*. London: Routledge.
- Fowler, R., Hodge, B., Kress, G., and Trew, T., 2018. *Language and control*. London: Routledge. (originally published in 1979)
- Fraser N (2003) Den radikala fantasin: Mellan omfördelning och erkännande. Göteborg: Daidalos
- Fraser, N. and Gordon, L., 1994. A genealogy of dependency: Tracing a keyword of the US welfare state. *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society*, 19(2), pp.309-336.
- Geiger, B.B., 2018. Benefit ‘myths’? The accuracy and inaccuracy of public beliefs about the benefits system. *Social Policy & Administration*, 52(5), pp.998-1018.
- Gramsci, A., Hoare, Q. and Nowell-Smith, G., 1971. *Selections from the prison notebooks of Antonio Gramsci*. London: Lawrence & Wishart.

Hall, S., 1980. Cultural studies: Two paradigms. *Media, Culture & Society*, 2(1), pp.57-72. London: Academic Press Inc.

Hall, S., 2005. The rediscovery of 'ideology': Return of the repressed in media studies. In *Culture, society and the media* (pp. 61-95). London and New York: Routledge.

Halliday, M.A.K., 1978. *Language as social semiotic: The social interpretation of language and meaning*. Hodder Arnold.

Hammersley, M., 1997. On the Foundations of Critical Discourse Analysis. *Language & Communication*, 17(3), pp.237-48. London and New York: Routledge

Hughes, B., 2015. Disabled people as counterfeit citizens: The politics of resentment past and present. *Disability & Society*, 30(7), pp.991-1004.

Johnson, B., 2010. *Kampen om sjukfrånvaron*. Arkiv förlag.

Landén, M., Wålinder, J. and Lundström, B., 1996. Prevalence, incidence and sex ratio of transsexualism. *Acta Psychiatrica Scandinavica*, 93(4), pp.221-223.

Larrain, J.L. 1979. *The concept of ideology*. London: Hutchinson.

Longmore, P., 2013. 'Heaven's Special Child': The Making of Poster Children. *The Disability Studies Reader*, pp.34-41.

Lundström, R., 2013. Framing fraud: Discourse on benefit cheating in Sweden and the UK. *European Journal of Communication*, 28(6), pp.630-645.

McEnhill, L. and Byrne, V., 2014. 'Beat the cheat': portrayals of disability benefit claimants in print media. *Journal of Poverty and Social Justice*, 22(2), pp.99-110.

Oorschot, W.V., 2000. Who should get what, and why? On deservingness criteria and the conditionality of solidarity among the public. *Policy & Politics*, 28(1), pp.33-48.

Svallfors, S., 1996. *Välfärdsstatens moraliska ekonomi: välfärdsopinionen i 90-talets Sverige*. Boréa.

Taylor-Gooby, P. ed., 2005. *Ideas and welfare state reform in Western Europe*. Springer.

Thompson, J.B. 1984. *Studies in the theory of ideology*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.

Van Dijk, T.A. 1998. *Ideology*. London: Sage

Vetenskapsrådet, S., 2002. *Forskningsetiska principer inom humanistisksamhällsvetenskaplig forskning*. Stockholm: Vetenskapsrådet.

Wodak, R. and Meyer, M., 2009. Critical discourse analysis: History, agenda, theory, and methodology. *Methods of critical discourse analysis*, 2, pp.1-33.

Webpages:

Aftonbladet. (2019). "Ny LSS-lag klar redan i sommar". [online] Available at: <https://www.aftonbladet.se/nyheter/a/BJQMjl/ny-lss-lag-klar-redan-i-sommar> [Accessed 18 Aug. 2019].

Arbetet, arbetet.se/om/

Arbetet. No.8, 2019

Enklarevardag.se. (2019). *Enklare Vardag – Vilka är vi?*. [online] Available at: <http://www.enklarevardag.se/om-oss/> [Accessed 20 Jun. 2019].

Klint, L., Alm, A., Andersson, A., Berthelson, L., Julius, S. and Björnstedt, J. (2019). *Facket i möte om asylsökandes villkor*. [online] Handelsnytt.se. Available at: <https://handelsnytt.se/2016/06/17/facket-i-mote-om-asylsökandes-villkor/> [Accessed 3 Sep. 2019].

Migrationsverket.se. (2019). *Olika skäl för uppehållstillstånd*. [online] Available at: <https://www.migrationsverket.se/Om-Migrationsverket/Migration-till-Sverige/Olika-skal-for-uppehållstillstand.html> [Accessed 17 Aug. 2019].

sweden.se. (2019). *Openness shapes Swedish society*. [online] Available at: <https://sweden.se/society/openness-shapes-swedish-society/> [Accessed 3 Sep. 2019].

Unionen. (2019). *This is how the Swedish labour market works*. [online] Available at: <https://www.unionen.se/in-english/how-swedish-labour-market-works> [Accessed 3 Sep. 2019].

Waltersson, Y., Hennel, L., Nilsson, K. and Klepke, M. (2019). *Om Arbetet*. [online] Arbetet.se. Available at: <https://arbetet.se/om/> [Accessed 20 Jun. 2019].